

# WHITE PAPER



# **Report on Status of Civic Issues in Mumbai**

April 2019



## Table of Contents

Ι.	Foreword	5
II.	Acknowledgement	7
City	/ Summary	8
Tab	le 1: Status Report of Total Complaints from Year 2016 to 2018	8
Tab	le 2: Civic Complaints by Citizens in Mumbai during Calendar Years 2016 to 2018	9
Tab	le 3: Ward-wise Total Complaints from Year 2016 to 2018	10
Gra	ph 1: MCGM Budget Estimates v/s Revised Estimates v/s Actuals from FY 2013-14 to 2019-20	11
Tab	le 4: Manpower Available for Civic-related Departments as of 31 <sup>st</sup> Dec 2018	12
Tab	le 5: Issue-wise Number of Questions Asked in Ward Committees in 2017 and 2018	13
	ele 6: Ward Committee and Ward-wise Number of Meetings, Attendance in (%) and No. of Question and from January 2018 to December 2018	
	le 7: Ward-wise Disparity of Pay & Use Toilets as of 31 <sup>st</sup> December 2018	
	le 8: Air Quality Index Level-wise Number of Days from 2016 to 2018	
	tion I. Civic Complaints	
	le 9: Issue wise comparison of Total complaints and Complaints closed	
	le 10: Issue wise Comparison of Total Complaints and Action taken on Complaints	
	le 11: Issue-wise Status of Action Taken Report Generated on Complaints in 2018	
	le 12: Category-wise Status of Complaints Escalated in the Year 2018	
	le 13: Sub-issue Wise Top Four Civic Complaints by Citizens during the Calendar Years 2016 to 2018	
Gra	ph 2: Comparison of Most Frequent Complaints by Citizens from Jan 2016 to Dec 2018	22
Tab	le 14: Analysis of Complaints Attended (Closed) in Comparison with Days Mentioned in MCGM's C	itizen
Cha	irter	23
Tab	le 15: Ward Wise Comparison of Total Complaints and Complaints Closed	24
Tab	le 16: Status Report of Complaints in Year 2018	25
Tab	le 17: Ward Wise Comparison of Total Complaints and Action Taken on the Complaints	26
Tab	le 18: Ward wise comparison of Total complaints and Complaints Escalated	27
Tab	le 19: Ward-wise Top Civic Complaints for the Calendar Years 2016 to 2018	28
Tab	le 20: Ward-wise Top Civic Complaints for the Calendar Years 2016 to 2018	29
Tab	le 21: Ward-wise Top Three Road Related Civic Complaints for the Years 2016 to 2018	30
Tab	le 22: Ward-wise Top Three Drainage Related Civic Complaints in the Years 2016 to 2018	31
	le 23: Ward-wise Top Three Solid Waste Management Related Civic Complaints in the Years 2016 t .8	
Tab	le 24: Top Four Water Supply Related Ward-wise Civic Complaints in the Years 2016 to 2018	33
Tab	le 25: Ward-wise Average Number of Days for Closing Complaints in the Year 2018	34



Table 26: Ward-wise average number of days for closing complaints in the year 2018	35
Section II: Analysis of Municipal Budget of 2019-20 relating to Civic Issues and Manpower Available with Municipal Corporation of Greater Mumbai	36
Table 27: Reduction in Budget Estimates in Revenue Expenditure	36
Table 28: Reduction in Budget Estimates in Capital Expenditure	36
Table 29: Budgetary Allocation of Departments Related to Civic Issues for FY 2019-20	36
Graph 3: Share of Departments in the Budget of FY 2019-20	37
Table 30: Roads, Traffic Operations & Bridges	38
Table 31: Storm Water Drains Department	38
Table 32: 'G' Budget (Water & Sewerage Operations)	39
Table 33: Solid Waste Management & Transport	39
Section III. MCGM Manpower	40
Table 34: Department-Wise MCGM Manpower as of 31 <sup>st</sup> Dec 2018	40
Section IV: Functioning of Ward Committees	42
Table 35: Total number of Meetings, Attendance and Questions Asked in Ward Committees	43
Table 36: Number of Questions Asked by Councillors in Ward Committees	43
Graph 4: Types of Devices Used by Councillors in the Year 2018 (January to December)	44
Table 37: : Types of Devices Used by Councillors from March 2017 to December 2018	44
Graph 5: Answers Given by Administration to Point of Order Questions Raised in Ward committee Meetings	45
Graph 6: Comparison of the Average Days Taken to Answer Point of Order Questions in the Ward Committees from 2014 to 2018	46
Table 38: Top Three Wards in Complaints and Questions in Proportion to the Ward Population in the Year         2018	
Table 39: Top Three Wards in Complaints and Its Number of Questions in the Year 2018	47
Table 40: Top Three Wards in Questions Asked in Proportion to the Number of Councillors Elected from the Ward in the Year 2018	
Table 41: Issue-wise Questions Asked by Councillors during the period January 2018 to December 2018	49
Section V. Analysis of Political Party Manifestos	51
Table 42: Party Wise Summary of Manifesto Points and Questions Raised from March 2018 to December         2018	52
Section VI: Open Defecation Free (ODF) status given to Greater Mumbai	53
Table 43: Number of Pay & Use Toilets in Greater Mumbai as of 31st December 2018	54
Section VII: Air Quality and the Health of Mumbai	55
Graph 7: Month-wise Average Air Quality Index (AQI) in 2018	56



Table 44: Average Month-wise AQI from April 2015 to December 2018	56
Graph 8: Month wise Air Quality Index from Jan 2016 to Dec 2018	57
Table 45: AQI of Year-wise Best and Worst Days of 2016, 2017 and 2018	58
Table 46: Comparison of Pollution Complaints	59
What needs to be done?	60
Annexure	62
Table 47: Issues of Complaints Included in Citizen's Charter	62
Table 48: Issue-wise Details of Complaints on Level 0 in 2018	63
Table 49: Issue-wise Details of Complaints on Level I in 2018	64
Table 50: Issue-wise Details of Complaints on Level II in 2018	65
Table 51: Issue-wise Details of Complaints on Level III in 2018	66
Table 52: Issue-wise Details of Complaints on Level IV in 2018	67
Table 53: Ward-wise Details of Complaints on Level 0 in 2018	68
Table 54: Ward-wise Details of Complaints on Level I in 2018	69
Table 55: Ward-wise Details of Complaints on Level II in 2018	70
Table 56: Ward-wise Details of Complaints on Level III in 2018	71
Table 57: Ward-wise Details of Complaints on Level IV in 2018.	72
Table 58: Party-wise Number of Questions Asked by Councillors during January 2017 to December 2018	73
Table 59: Party-wise Number of Questions Asked on Civic Issues during January 2017 to December 2018	<b>3</b> .73
Table 60: Party-wise Number of Questions Asked on Civic Issues during January 2017 to December 2018	<b>3</b> .74
Table 61: List of Councillors Who Asked Zero Questions in Ward Committees from Mar 2017 to Dec 201	<b>8</b> 75
Table 62: Bhartiya Janta Party (BJP) Manifesto	76
Table 63: Shiv Sena (SS) Manifesto	81
Table 64: Indian National Congress (INC) Manifesto	83
Table 65: National Congress Party (NCP) Manifesto	85



### ı. Foreword

Mumbai is endearingly known by many names; The City of Dreams, The City that never sleeps, Maximum City being some among them. It is difficult to fathom that this city is governed by the largest civic body in Asia, and the crumbling infrastructure in the city is a constant reminder of the mismanagement of the resources available at the city's disposal. In an effort to compare the budgetary provisions and complaints to the manpower, for the first time, Praja Foundation has obtained information relating to the available manpower in the Municipal Corporation of Greater Mumbai (MCGM).

The city's government is failing to provide basic civic amenities, which is evidenced in the number of complaints that citizens are registering through the Centralised Complaint Registration System (CCRS) of the MCGM. In the last 3 calendar years, from 2016 to 2018, the number of complaints registered has risen by 43%. Also, the average number of days taken to resolve these complaints has almost remained constant, from 48 days in 2017 to 46 days in 2018. On a positive note, this increase in the number of complaints also means that there is heightened awareness amongst the citizens about the complaint mechanism of the city, which they are using to voice their concerns about civic issues. This rise has also been consistent from the years preceding 2016 as well. To its credit, however, the MCGM closed 83% of complaints in 2018, which is a sharp increase from 58% in 2016.

With tragic and completely avoidable mishaps occurring on a regular basis, the citizens of Mumbai, as well as the people who have chosen to call it home are finding everyday mundane activities difficult to process. The lack of accountability on the administration has led to bridges being given a clean chit despite structural flaws being found. This lack of accountability is evidenced in the gross under-utilisation of the MCGM budget, and a drastic revision of the budget estimates to the revised estimates. The Capital Expenditure, provisioned for project works, has consistently shown a reduction in the Budget Estimates to the Revised Estimates, from 58% in 2016-17, 25% in 2017-18 and 18% in 2018-19. Similarly, the Roads, Traffic and Bridges departments only utilised two-thirds of their budget in 2017-18, which indicates either that the Municipal Corporation does not have the skill to execute the provisioned work, or that they are poor at allocating resources for work that the city is starved for.

Additionally, as per the manpower data received from the MCGM, the Bridges Department also shows a 40% shortage, despite the city government sanctioning the required number of posts. The overall vacancy rate also stands at 34% across all the MCGM departments.

Even when complaints are registered, the councillor code, which pins down both the councillor as well as the administration responsible for resolving the issue, was not filled in 76% of the cases in 2018, 77% of the cases in 2017 and 69% of the cases in 2016.

There is reason to be joyous, however, on the deliberative front. Despite a decrease in attendance of councillors in ward committee meetings from 82% in 2017 to 79% in 2018, MCGM's councillors asked 1,046 questions in committee meetings, a 22% increase from 856 questions in 2017. They also conducted more meetings in 2018 (a 16% increase from 2017), which suggests that our elected representatives are holding more meetings to ask more questions to the administration. The number of councillors asking no question in ward committee meetings, however, is still at a staggering 31 councillors, which is an unacceptably high number. Additionally, 15% of all the questions asked by Councillors in Ward Committee meetings in 2018 were on 'Naming/Renaming of Roads', which is not in alignment with the urgent issues facing the citizens of Mumbai.

Last year, we had reported that there is a shocking disparity of 64% in the number of public (Pay & Use) toilets provided for men over women. It was also found that there were several wards in Mumbai with *no* facilities provided for their differently abled population. Unfortunately, this year the disparity has increased to 66% and no new facilities have been provided for the differently-able either.



As always it is our endeavour through our White Paper to highlight the issues that concern the citizens. Our approach is to report the realities and engage with our ER's and Government to bring about the change and improvements required, which will be beneficial to the citizens and the city. Through our fellowship programs in Mumbai and Delhi and our collaborative one-on-one engagements with Municipal Councillors in Mumbai, we are striving to provide stakeholders with all the data-driven support they require.

NITAI MEHTA Founder Trustee, Praja Foundation

**Note:** MCGM maintains complaints received through various portals on the Central Complaint Registration System (CCRS). Praja Foundation obtains all data relating to complaints, escalation, and action taken on complaints through RTI applications. The 'Citizen's Charter' shown in this White Paper refers to the document of 1999, which was a combined effort of the MCGM and Praja Foundation. It has been used as a reference document to gauge the difference between time in which a citizen expects a complaint to be solved and the actual time taken to solve a complaint.



#### Acknowledgement П.

Praja has obtained the data used in compiling this white paper through Right to Information Act, 2005. Hence it is very important to acknowledge the RTI Act and everyone involved, especially the officials who have provided us this information diligently.

We would like to appreciate our stakeholders; particularly, our Elected Representatives & government officials, the Civil Society Organizations (CSOs) and the journalists who utilize and publicize our data and, by doing so, ensure that awareness regarding various issues that we discuss is distributed to a wide-ranging population. We would like to take this opportunity to specifically extend our gratitude to all government officials for their continuous cooperation and support.

Praja Foundation appreciates the support given by our supporters and donors, namely European Union Fund, Friedrich Naumann Foundation, A.T.E Chandra Foundation, Narotam Sekhsaria Foundation and Madhu Mehta Foundation and numerous other individual supporters. Their support has made it possible for us to conduct our study & publish this white paper.

We would also like to thank our group of Advisors & Trustees and lastly but not the least, we would like to acknowledge the contributions of all members of Praja's team, who worked to make this white paper a reality.

Note: The contents of this publication are published by Praja Foundation and in no way can be taken to reflect the views of the European Union and other donors and sponsors.





Narotam Sekhsaria Foundation

Madhu Mehta Foundation



# **City Summary**

#### Table 1: Status Report of Total Complaints from Year 2016 to 2018



- Total no. of Complaints in Mumbai have steadily increased from 81,555 in 2016 to 1,16,658 in 2018, which is an increase of 43% in 3 years.
- The Councillor Code<sup>1</sup> was not filled for 76% of the citizen complaints registered in 2018 as compared to 69% in 2016, which means that the filling of Councillor code has consistently not being taken seriously.
- According to the Citizen's Charter<sup>2</sup>, it should take, on an average, 3 days to resolve the complaints.
- This means that even though more complaints are being closed, it is taking a lot more time to close them. A reason for this lack of time-bound service delivery could be that there is no mechanism for citizen's feedback after a complaint is resolved. There is no way for a citizen to give feedback on the way their complaint was resolved, or after the complaint is registered.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> While solving complaints the engineer concerned has to mention the councillor name (code) for each complaint, based on the constituency that the complaint belongs to. This is compulsory and should be filled out rigorously. This will assist councillors to get the list of constituency-wise complaints.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> 18 issues are included in the Citizen's Charter. Refer to Table 47 in Annexure.



#### Table 2: Civic Complaints by Citizens in Mumbai during Calendar Years 2016 to 2018

Issues	2016	Change from 2016 to 2017 (in %)	2017	Change from 2017 to 2018 (in %)	2018
Roads	13,475	<b>↓</b> -14%	11,606	16%	13,458
Buildings	16,257	19%	19,267	<b>9</b> %	21,014
Drainage	12,269	<b>1</b> 30%	15,940	<b>1</b> 29%	20,641
Water Supply	7,246	-4%	6,959	<b>1</b> 82%	12,647
Solid Waste Management (SWM)	7,330	<b>1</b> 38%	10,144	43%	14,494
License	8,368	<b>1</b> 24%	10,372	<b>1</b> 37%	14,203
Pest control	6,078	-9%	5,529	<b>1</b> 21%	6,703
Garden	1,658	11%	1,844	<b>59%</b>	2,936
Colony Officer	1,954	-36%	1,245	15%	1,437
Storm Water Drainage	1,386	11%	1,532	1%	1,548
Shop and Establishment (S & E)	561	163%	1,478	-41%	878
Medical Officer Health (MOH)	1,111	44%	1,595	<b>1</b> 9%	1,743
MCGM related	862	<b>1</b> 3%	889	-1%	877
Estate	560	-27%	407	44%	588
Toilet	290	43%	416	19%	494
Pollution	220	-2%	215	<b>1</b> 33%	286
School	74	43%	42	1 38%	58
Nuisance due to vagrants on municipal roads, footpaths, gardens	1,856	<b>†</b> 54%	2,849	<b>↓</b> -7%	2,653
Mumbai	81,555	<b>13%</b>	92,329	<b>1</b> 26%	116,658

- Water Supply complaints showed the largest increase from 2017 to 2018 (82%).
- Complaints related to Solid Waste Management have consistently risen from 2016 to 2018, showing a 38% increase from 2016 to 2017, and a further increase of 43% from 2017 to 2018.
- Similarly, complaints related to Toilets have also steadily increased from 2016 to 2018, showing an overall increase of 70% in the past 3 years.
- Complaints related to Pest control and Pollution showed an increase of 21% and 33% respectively from 2017 to 2018.
- Interestingly, complaints relating to Shops and Establishments (S & E) showed the highest increase of 163% from 2016 to 2017, and it showed a **decrease** of 41% from 2017 to 2018.



#### Table 3: Ward-wise Total Complaints from Year 2016 to 2018

#### Inference:

A

В

С

D

Ε

F/N

F/S

G/N

G/S

H/E

H/W

K/E

K/W

M/W

P/N

P/S

R/C

R/N

R/S

3,040

1,593

81,555

29%

29%

13%

S

Т

Total

Ν

L M/E

> B ward (Sandhurst Road) recorded the highest increase in Civic Complaints from 2017 to 2018 (70%).

3,923

2,050

92,329

30%

27%

26%

5,115

2,611

116,658

- Overall, all Wards have seen an increase in the percentage of civic complaints (26%) from 2017 to 2018. This is also a bigger increase in complaints compared to that from 2016 to 2017 (13%).
- B ward also has the biggest jump in increase of complaints, from 22% (2016 to 2017) to 70% (2017 to 2018).





Graph 1: MCGM Budget Estimates v/s Revised Estimates v/s Actuals from FY 2013-14 to 2019-20

- On an average, there was a 18% reduction from Budget Estimates to Revised Estimates from 2013-14 to 2018-19.
- There was a 33% reduction from Budget Estimates to Revised Estimates in 2016-17. This means that one-third of the Budget Estimates were slashed in the Revised Estimates.
- There is a big gap between Budget Estimates and Actuals, and Actuals are always invariably lower than Revised Estimates.



#### Table 4: Manpower Available for Civic-related Departments as of 31<sup>st</sup> Dec 2018

MCGM PE	RSONNEL	-	
Department*	Sanctioned	Available	Vacant (%)
Water Supply and Sewerage Department	467	396	15%
Mumbai Fire Brigade	4,175	3,191	24%
Solid Waste Management Department	35,181	28,664	19%
Storm Water Drains Department	3,377	2,025	40%
Water Engineer's Department	10,834	6,604	39%
Water Supply Project Department	554	243	56%
Sewerage Propulsion Department	7,815	4,324	45%
Sewerage Project	454	178	<b>61%</b>
Roads & Traffic Department	6,350	3,792	40%
Mumbai Sewerage Project	86	50	42%
License Department	899	757	16%
Garden & Recreation Department	1,639	794	52%
Shops & Establishment Department	259	206	20%
Estate Department	1,542	1,148	26%
Markets Department	1,111	642	42%
Encroachment and Elimination Department	91	81	11%
Disaster Management Cell	281	94	<b>67%</b>
Bridges Department	141	85	40%
Coastal Road Project	42	19	55%
Other Departments	81,971	50,648	38%
MCGM Total**	1,57,269	1,03,941	34%

Note: Above data is inclusive of 'Scheduled', 'Non-Scheduled' and 'Other Posts in the MCGM

#### Inference:

There is an overall vacancy of 34% in MCGM, with 67% vacancy in Disaster Management Cell & 40% • vacancy in Bridges Department.



#### Table 5: Issue-wise Number of Questions Asked in Ward Committees in 2017 and 2018



- Highest number of questions (208) asked were related to 'Roads' in 2018. This was closely followed by questions on 'Naming/Renaming of Roads/ Chowks', with 158 questions.
- Overall, we can deduce that councillors in 2018 asked more questions than in 2017, which is a heartening sign.



# Table 6: Ward Committee and Ward-wise Number of Meetings, Attendance in (%) and No. of Questions Asked from January 2018 to December 2018

Sr.		No. of	No. of	No. of Atten		No. of questions asked by councillors				
No.	Ward Councillor Meeti s ngs		dance (in %)	Questi on asked	Zero Que.	1 to 5 Que.	6 to 10 Que.	Abov e 10 Que.		
1	Ward Committee A, B and E									
	Α	3		67%	12	0	3	0	0	
	В	2	16	69%	5	0	2	0	0	
	Ε	7		75%	25	2	2	3	0	
2	Ward Committee C and D				-	-	-	-		
	С	3	17	94%	4	0	3	0	0	
	D	6	17	91%	19	0	5	1	0	
3	Ward Committee F/South an	d F/North								
	F/N	10	20	70%	35	1	8	1	0	
	F/S	7	20	90%	26	1	5	1	0	
4	Ward Committee G/North	11	13	77%	12	5	6	0	0	
5	Ward Committee G/South	7	14	81%	92	0	2	2	3	
6	Ward Committee H/East and	H/West								
	H/E	10	14	67%	34	3	3	4	0	
	H/W	6	14	77%	28	1	2	3	0	
7	Ward Committee K/East	15	20	73%	70	3	8	2	2	
8	Ward Committee K/West	13	16	84%	109	0	3	6	4	
9	Ward Committee L	16	15	73%	93	1	8	5	2	
10	Ward Committee M/East	15	13	76%	31	5	8	2	0	
11	Ward Committee M/West	7	17	89%	63	0	1	3	3	
12	Ward Committee N	11	15	76%	31	0	10	1	0	
13	Ward Committee P/North	18	14	80%	112	1	7	8	2	
14	Ward Committee P/South	9	15	79%	32	1	7	0	1	
15	Ward Committee R/Central a	and R/North								
	R/C	10	26	85%	56	0	6	3	1	
	R/N	8	26	86%	48	0	4	3	1	
16	Ward Committee R/South	13	20	77%	60	2	7	2	2	
17	Ward Committee S and T									
	S	14	1.4	81%	31	4	8	2	0	
	Т	6	14	68%	18	1	4	1	0	
	Total	227	279	<b>79</b> %	1,046	31	122	53	21	

- C Ward has highest number of attendance (94%) in 2018, while P/N has the highest number of question asked (112) in Ward Committee Meetings.
- More than 10 questions were asked by only 2% of all councillors, i.e. only 21 Councillors in the Ward Committee.



#### Table 7: Ward-wise Disparity of Pay & Use Toilets as of 31<sup>st</sup> December 2018<sup>3</sup>





- A, B, C, D, E, and G/S wards have the highest disparity in public toilets in Mumbai.
- G/N, K/E, M/E, M/W, R/C, and R/N wards have the lowest disparity in public toilets in Mumbai.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Numbers are addition of number of Urinals and Toilets (WCs) only, they do not include Bathrooms.



#### Table 8: Air Quality Index Level-wise Number of Days from 2016 to 2018

Air Quality Lough	No. of Days						
Air Quality Level	2016	2017	2018				
Good	65	45	0				
Satisfactory	177	134	138				
Moderate	107	144	125				
Poor	17	23	16				
Very Poor	0	0	0				
Severe	0	1	0				
Total	366*	347^	279#				

\* - 2016 was a leap year

^ - 18 days had an 'NA' against their Air Qualities from the data we obtained in 2017

# - 86 days had an 'NA' against their Air Qualities from the data we obtained in 2018

- There were 0 (zero) days in 2018 with 'Good' Air Quality.
- Most number of days in 2018 had 'Satisfactory' Air Quality (138) followed by 'Moderate' Air Quality (125).



#### **Section I. Civic Complaints**

#### Table 9: Issue wise comparison of Total complaints and Complaints closed

Complaint Type	Total complaints received		Closed Complaints				Average days to resolve a complaint	
complaint Type	2017	2018	2017		2018		2017	2018
			In no.	In (%)	In no.	In (%)		
Roads	11,606	13,458	9,922	85%	10,533	78%	49	40
Buildings	19,267	21,014	12,607	65%	13,468	64%	86	77
Drainage	15,940	20,641	14,147	89%	17,849	86%	43	36
Water Supply	6,959	12,647	6,054	87%	11,978	95%	39	42
Solid Waste Management (SWM)	10,144	14,494	10,020	99%	12,999	90%	17	36
License	10,372	14,203	9,587	92%	12,803	90%	46	43
Pest control	5,529	6,703	5,139	93%	6,560	98%	38	36
Garden	1,844	2,936	968	52%	2,393	82%	52	66
Colony Officer	1,245	1,437	762	61%	1,147	80%	73	56
Storm Water Drainage	1,532	1,548	1,323	86%	1,165	75%	58	62
Shop and Establishment	1,478	878	1,376	93%	825	94%	40	29
Medical Officer Health (MOH)	1,595	1,743	1,314	82%	1,530	88%	40	49
MCGM Related	889	877	710	80%	597	68%	66	56
Estate	407	588	221	54%	317	54%	80	86
Toilet	416	494	397	95%	433	88%	33	44
Pollution	215	286	128	60%	162	57%	83	76
School	42	58	21	50%	29	50%	94	108
Nuisance due to vagrants on municipal roads, footpaths, gardens	2,849	2,653	2,067	73%	1,755	66%	57	68
Grand Total	92,329	1,16,658	76,763	83%	96,543	83%	48	46

- There has been a slight decrease in the average number of days taken to resolve a complaint from 2017 to 2018 (48 days in 2017 to 46 days in 2018).
- Highest number of days taken to resolve complaints in 2018 was related to 'School' (108 days), while the lowest number of days taken was related to 'Shop and Establishment' (29 days).
- Complaints regarding basic civic services also took high time to resolve. Such as Toilet (44 Days), Water Supply (42 Days), Drainage, Solid Waste Management (SWM) and Pest Control took 36 days to resolve.



Table 10: Issue wise Com	parison of Total Com	plaints and Action t	aken on Complaints
TUDIC TO: ISSUE WISE COM	pullison of rotal com	ipiunits una Action (	anch on complaints

		mplaints eived	Action Taken Report*				
Complaint Type	2017	2018	20	17	2018		
			In no.	In (%)	In no.	In (%)	
Roads	11,606	13,458	9,973	86%	10,586	79%	
Buildings	19,267	21,014	12,562	65%	13,526	64%	
Drainage	15,940	20,641	14,019	88%	17,869	87%	
Water Supply	6,959	12,647	6,030	87%	12,006	95%	
Solid Waste Management (SWM)	10,144	14,494	9,013	89%	13,010	90%	
License	10,372	14,203	9,578	92%	12,826	90%	
Pest control	5,529	6,703	5,147	93%	6,565	98%	
Garden	1,844	2,936	972	53%	2,403	82%	
Colony Officer	1,245	1,437	770	62%	1,165	81%	
Storm Water Drainage	1,532	1,548	1,324	86%	1,166	75%	
Shop and Establishment	1,478	878	1,372	93%	821	94%	
Medical Officer Health (MOH)	1,595	1,743	1,302	82%	1,524	87%	
MCGM Related	889	877	715	80%	602	69%	
Estate	407	588	223	55%	323	55%	
Toilet	416	494	361	87%	433	88%	
Pollution	215	286	128	60%	162	57%	
School	42	58	22	52%	30	52%	
Nuisance due to vagrants on municipal roads, footpaths, gardens	2,849	2,653	2,072	73%	1,759	66%	
Grand Total	92,329	1,16,658	75,583	<b>82</b> %	96,776	83%	

\*differs from 'Complaints Closed'

- Action Taken Report (ATR) generation was highest for complaints related to 'Pest Control' (98%), while it was lowest for complaints related to 'School' (52%).
- ATR generation was only 79% for complaints related to 'Roads'.



#### Table 11: Issue-wise Status of Action Taken Report Generated on Complaints in 2018

Complaint Type	Total complaints Action		Forwarded to Department		False Complaint		Action Taken/ Service Provided		Action Not Initiated	
	received	Taken	In no.	In (%)	In no.	In (%)	In no.	In (%)	In no.	In (%)
Roads	13,458	10,586	290	2%	501	4%	9,795	73%	2,872	21%
Buildings	21,014	13,526	98	0%	2,446	12%	10,982	52%	7,488	36%
Drainage	20,641	17,869	215	1%	1,133	5%	16,521	80%	2,772	13%
Water Supply	12,647	12,006	2,300	18%	893	7%	8,813	70%	641	5%
Solid Waste Management (SWM)	14,494	13,010	2	0%	757	5%	12,251	85%	1,484	10%
License	14,203	12,826	3	0%	1,574	11%	11,249	79%	1,377	10%
Pest control	6,703	6,565	0	0%	398	6%	6,167	92%	138	2%
Garden	2,936	2,403	97	3%	340	12%	1,966	67%	533	18%
Colony Officer	1,437	1,165	28	2%	408	28%	729	51%	272	19%
Storm Water Drainage	1,548	1,166	1	0%	43	3%	1,122	72%	382	25%
Shop and Establishment	878	821	0	0%	726	83%	95	11%	57	6%
Medical Officer Health (MOH)	1,743	1,524	50	3%	161	9%	1,313	75%	219	13%
MCGM Related	877	602	13	1%	22	3%	567	65%	275	31%
Estate	588	323	17	3%	195	33%	111	19%	265	45%
Toilet	494	433	0	0%	30	6%	403	82%	61	12%
Pollution	286	162	78	27%	54	19%	30	10%	124	43%
School	58	30	4	7%	14	24%	12	21%	28	48%
Nuisance due to vagrants on municipal roads, footpaths, gardens	2,653	1,759	0	0%	135	5%	1,624	61%	894	34%
Grand Total	1,16,658	96,776	3,196	3%	9,830	8%	83,750	72%	19,882	17%

- Action was taken or a service was provided for only 10% of complaints related to 'Pollution' in 2018, whereas no Action was initiated for 48% of complaints related to 'School'.
- Approximately 1 in every 10 (8%) complaints were false complaints in 2018.

	Total	Escalated Complaints					
Complaint Type	Complaints Received	Level I (AMC/Chief Engineer)	Level II (DMC)	Level III (Add. MC)	Level IV (MC)		
Roads	13,458	2,943	2,943	2,943	2,943		
Buildings	21,014	7,669	7,481	7,267	7,118		
Drainage	20,641	2,828	2,826	2,826	2,731		
Water Supply	12,647	3	3	3	3		
Solid Waste Management (SWM)	14,494	1,546	1,532	1,532	1,532		
License	14,203	1,478	1,472	1,472	1,472		
Pest control	6,703	161	150	150	150		
Garden	2,936	558	558	558	558		
Colony Officer	1,437	304	302	302	302		
Storm Water Drainage	1,548	390	390	390	380		
Shop and Establishment	878	47	47	47	47		
Medical Officer Health (MOH)	1,743	221	221	221	221		
MCGM Related	877	282	282	282	282		
Estate	588	219	219	219	219		
Toilet	494	64	64	64	64		
Pollution	286	126	124	124	124		
School	58	29	29	29	29		
Nuisance due to vagrants on municipal roads, footpaths, gardens	2,653	904	904	904	904		
Total	1,16,658	19,772	19,547	19,333	19,079		
In (%)		17%	17%	17%	16%		

#### Table 12: Category-wise Status of Complaints Escalated in the Year 2018

The table above depicts the number of complaints escalated to different levels under the 'escalation matrix' which has been adopted by the MCGM. The escalation matrix was developed to address the problem of complaints remaining stuck at the lower level of the civic administration, with no way to enforce accountability. Through this system, the higher administration is mandated to take note of and address complaints if they are not solved within a stipulated time.

- If a complaint is solved at the level at which it is filed, it is treated as being solved at Level 0. As can be seen through the data, once complaints are escalated, they reach the highest level i.e. that of the Municipal Commissioner, 19,079 out of 19,772 (96.50%) cases in 2018.
- Total of 693 complaints were resolved at Level IV out of 19,772 complaints registered at Level I in 2018.



Issues/Sub-issues	2016	2017	2018	Increase from 2016 to 2017 (in %)	Increase from 2017 to 2018 (in %)
Roads		•			
Bad Patches / Potholes on the Roads	5,841	4,164	4,918	-29%	18%
Municipal Land - Road/ Footpath/SWD	2,823	2,721	3,374	-4%	24%
Resurfacing of Road	1,009	1,239	1,281	23%	3%
Total complaints	13,475	11,606	13,458	-14%	16%
Drainage					
Drainage Chokes and Blockages	7,199	9,256	12,403	29%	34%
Overflowing drains of manholes	3,107	4,346	4,290	40%	-1%
Replacement of Missing / Damaged Manhole	657	957	2,469	46%	158%
Total complaints	12,269	15,940	20,641	30%	29%
Solid Waste Management (SWM)					
Garbage not lifted from House/Gully/Municipal Market/Road/Authorised collection point	2,109	3,597	5,157	71%	43%
Removal of Debris	1,241	1,625	2,122	31%	31%
Lifting of Tree Cutting	635	794	1,241	25%	56%
Providing/removing/replacing dustbins	425	499	552	17%	11%
Collection point not attended properly	1,002	565	644	-44%	14%
Total complaints	7,330	10,144	14,494	38%	43%
Water Supply					
Shortage of Water Supply	2,491	2,253	3,477	-10%	54%
Leaks in Water Lines	1,436	1,333	4,491	-7%	237%
Unauthorised Tapping of Water Connection	976	939	1,308	-4%	39%
Contaminated Water Supply	980	1,207	1,156	23%	-4%
Total complaints	7,246	6,959	12,647	<b>-4</b> %	82%

#### Table 13: Sub-issue Wise Top Four Civic Complaints by Citizens during the Calendar Years 2016 to 2018

- There has been a consistent rise in Complaints related to "Garbage not lifted from House/Gully/Municipal Market/Road/Authorised collection point", from 2,109 in 2016 to 3,597 in 2017 (71% increase) and 5,157 in 2018 (43%). It is an overall 145% increase from 2016 to 2018.
- Total Solid Waste Management (SWM) complaints have increased by 38% from 2016 to 2017 and 43% from 2017 to 2018.



#### Graph 2: Comparison of Most Frequent Complaints<sup>4</sup> by Citizens from Jan 2016 to Dec 2018

Note: The percentages mentioned in brackets indicate the share of complaints related to that issue with respect to total number of complaints. For e.g. In 2018, 12% of total complaints were related to 'Roads'.



- Complaints related to 'Drainage issues' (15,940 in 2017 and 20,641 in 2018) is the most frequently complained about issue in both 2017 and 2018. It constitutes almost one-fifth (18%) of all complaints.
- Over the last three years, complaints related to Licences, Drainage, Solid Waste Management, and Water Supply have all increased and those related to Roads have very slightly decreased. This indicates that more and more citizens in Mumbai are agitated by the government's lack of preparedness towards the monsoons, garbage, and ease of doing business.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> The complaints registered data is obtained through RTI from the Central Complaint Registration System (CCRS) of the MCGM



# Table 14: Analysis of Complaints Attended (Closed) in Comparison with Days Mentioned in MCGM's Citizen Charter<sup>5</sup>

		Actu	ial time tak	en to res	olve
Issues/Sub-issues	To be resolved as per Citizens' Charter	2016	2017	2018	Increase from 2017 to 2018 (in %)
Drai	nage				
Drainage Chokes and Blockages	1	11	32	25	-24%
Overflowing drains or manholes	1	20	56	53	-6%
Odour (Foul Smell) from Drains	1	20	71	49	-31%
Replacement of Missing / Damaged Manhole	1	21	66	58	-11%
Raising of Manhole (except in Monsoon)	7	17	40	43	8%
Cleaning of septic tank	7	24	56	71	27%
Repairs to pipe sewers/main sewers	7	20	60	56	-6%
Water	Supply				-
Contaminated Water Supply	1	19	37	38	3%
Leaks in Water Lines	7	18	37	47	29%
Shortage of Water Supply	2	19	38	40	4%
Burst Water Main	1	17	37	47	25%
Solid Waste Mar	nagement (SV	VM)			
Garbage not lifted - Co-authorised Point	1	17	12	35	189%
Collection point not attended properly	1	15	22	37	69%
Garbage lorry not reported for service/ Lorry not covered	1	15	12	35	190%
Providing/removing/replacing dustbins	8	18	24	40	62%
Sweeping of road	1	15	16	33	110%
Removal of Dead Animals	1	12	19	33	74%
No attendance at public toilets	2	20	28	39	38%
Average	3	16	37	38	3%

- Breaking from the overall trend in Mumbai, average days taken to resolve a complaints related to SWM and Water Supply have largely increased from 2017 to 2018, while those relating to Drainage have decreased.
- It took 71 days to resolve complaints related to 'Cleaning of Septic tank' and 56 days (almost 2 months) to resolve complaints related to "Repairs to pipe sewers/main sewers" in 2018.
- Similarly, it took 58 days to resolve complaints related to "Replacement of missing/damaged manhole". This is particularly worrisome since there has been a continued trend of people dying in open manholes in monsoon.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Citizen Charter http://goo.gl/M8EL9h



Ward		mplaints eived		Closed C	omplaint	S	Averag to res comp	olve a
	2017	2018	20	17	20	018	2017	2018
	2017	2018	In no.	In (%)	In no.	In (%)	2017	2010
A	1,840	2,474	1,817	99%	2,468	100%**	86	59
В	2,341	3,972	1,277	55%	2,750	69%	34	64
С	2,895	3,696	2,201	76%	2,627	71%	29	37
D	4,053	4,815	4,029	99%	4,731	98%	36	20
E	3,183	4,337	3,178	100%*	4,138	95%	20	21
F/N	2,944	4,425	2,908	99%	4,329	98%	16	18
F/S	1,624	2,369	1,585	98%	2,316	98%	46	36
G/N	4,840	6,241	3,176	66%	2,825	45%	62	33
G/S	2,471	3,160	2,434	99%	2,545	81%	42	34
H/E	2,937	3,518	2,743	93%	3,091	88%	47	24
H/W	3,430	4,763	3,404	99%	4,721	99%	38	23
K/E	6,725	8,146	6,498	97%	8,017	98%	43	50
K/W	8,349	9,465	7,951	95%	9,071	96%	50	52
L	7,282	7,242	1,140	16%	5,286	73%	13	141
M/E	3,391	4,232	3,188	94%	3,926	93%	77	55
M/W	3,123	4,331	2,941	94%	3,996	92%	42	35
N	6,088	6,570	5,924	97%	6,422	98%	33	17
P/N	5,374	6,586	4,776	89%	4,406	67%	53	85
P/S	3,227	4,855	2,873	89%	3,700	76%	49	41
R/C	4,368	5,315	3,409	78%	3,247	61%	89	59
R/N	1,792	2,171	1,060	59%	1,087	50%	62	67
R/S	4,079	6,249	3,485	85%	6,206	99%	42	50
S	3,923	5,115	3,499	89%	3,443	67%	93	41
Т	2,050	2,611	1,267	62%	1,195	46%	50	21
Total	92,329	1,16,658	76,763	83%	96,543	83%	48	46

#### Table 15: Ward Wise Comparison of Total Complaints and Complaints Closed

\* Actual Percentage is 99.84%, which has been rounded off

\*\*Actual percentage is 99.76%, which has been rounded off

- L ward took the highest average number of days to close complaints (141 days) in 2018. N ward took the least amount of time to close complaints in the same year (17 days).
- A ward has almost all of its 2,474 complaints closed (2,468 closed complaints).
- G/N ward has only closed 45% of its complaints in 2018.
- Hence, ward wise data also proves that there is a direct correlation between number of closed complaints and average days taken to resolve/close the complaint. This means that the MCGM is not providing time-bound service delivery.



Ward	Total Complaints	Closed (Action taken)	Compl Registered Pendi	l (Action	In Process (Not assigned/Re Assigned/Being Attended)	Not related to MCGM		lor code given
			No.	In (%)			No.	In (%)
A	2,474	2,468	6 0		0	0	2,007	81
В	3,972	2,750	704	18	517	1	2,387	60
С	3,696	2,627	1,038	28	31	0	2,777	75
D	4,815	4,731	79	2	5	0	3,882	81
E	4,337	4,138	153	4	45	1	3,226	74
F/N	4,425	4,329	62	1	34	0	3,328	75
F/S	2,369	2,316	19	1	33	1	1,839	78
G/N	6,241	2,825	2,847	46	569	0	4,081	65
G/S	3,160	2,545	609	19	6	0	2,389	76
H/E	3,518	3,091	394	11	29	4	2,854	81
H/W	4,763	4,721	33	1	9	0	3,900	82
K/E	8,146	8,017	73	1	56	0	6,328	78
K/W	9,465	9,071	334	4	59	1	7,450	79
L	7,242	5,286	1,925	27	22	9	5,400	75
M/E	4,232	3,926	295	7	11	0	3,211	76
M/W	4,331	3,996	317	7	18	0	3,251	75
N	6,570	6,422	136	2	12	0	4,978	76
P/N	6,586	4,406	2,029	31	133	18	5,003	76
P/S	4,855	3,700	1,054	22	99	2	3,778	78
R/C	5,315	3,247	2,042	38	24	2	3,677	69
R/N	2,171	1,087	1,071	49	13	0	1,594	73
R/S	6,249	6,206	34	1	9	0	5,127	82
S	5,115	3,443	1,519	30	144	9	3,933	77
Т	2,611	1,195	1,415	54	1	0	1,954	75
Total	1.10.050	96,543	18,188		1,879	48	88,354	
In (%)	1,16,658	83%	16%		2%	0.04%	76%	

- R/S and H/W were the worst for filling councillor code, which was filled in only 18% of the complaints for both wards in 2018.
- Highest percentage for filling councillor code was B ward, with 40% complaints having filled councillor code in 2018.



Compleint Ture		mplaints eived		Action Tal	ken Report	
Complaint Type	2017	2019	20	17	20	18
	2017	2018	In no.	In (%)	In no.	In (%)
А	1,840	2,474	1,781	97%	2,468	100%*
В	2,341	3,972	1,278	55%	2,756	69%
С	2,895	3,696	2,190	76%	2,636	71%
D	4,053	4,815	3,951	97%	4,733	98%
E	3,183	4,337	3,161	99%	4,142	96%
F/N	2,944	4,425	2,858	97%	4,326	98%
F/S	1,624	2,369	1,564	96%	2,315	98%
G/N	4,840	6,241	3,040	63%	2,830	45%
G/S	2,471	3,160	2,386	97%	2,549	81%
H/E	2,937	3,518	2,739	93%	3,106	88%
H/W	3,430	4,763	3,365	98%	4,727	99%
K/E	6,725	8,146	6,483	96%	8,022	98%
K/W	8,349	9,465	7,856	94%	9,082	96%
L	7,282	7,242	732	10%	5,309	73%
M/E	3,391	4,232	3,140	93%	3,932	93%
M/W	3,123	4,331	2,932	94%	4,009	93%
Ν	6,088	6,570	5,919	97%	6,426	98%
P/N	5,374	6,586	4,752	88%	4,437	67%
P/S	3,227	4,855	2,864	89%	3,737	77%
R/C	4,368	5,315	3,359	77%	3,259	61%
R/N	1,792	2,171	1,045	58%	1,091	50%
R/S	4,079	6,249	3,478	85%	6,208	99%
S	3,923	5,115	3,467	88%	3,481	68%
Т	2,050	2,611	1,243	61%	1,195	46%
Total	92,329	1,16,658	75,583	82%	96,776	83%

#### Table 17: Ward Wise Comparison of Total Complaints and Action Taken on the Complaints

\*-Actual percentage is 99.76%, which has been rounded off

- G/N Ward has the lowest percentage of complaints on which Action Taken Report was generated (45%) in 2018. There is a drastic improvement from the lowest of 2017, which was L ward with 10% ATR generated in 2017 to 73% in 2018.
- Action Taken Report was generated in almost 100% of the cases in A ward in 2018.



#### Table 18: Ward wise comparison of Total complaints and Complaints Escalated

The table above depicts the number of complaints escalated to level 1 under the 'escalation matrix' which has been adopted by the MCGM. The escalation matrix was developed to address the problem of complaints remaining stuck at the lower level of the civic administration, with no way to enforce accountability. Through this system, the higher administration is mandated to take note of and address complaints if they are not solved within a stipulated time.



			R	oad			Drai	nage	
Ward	Population 2011	2016	2017	2018	Increase from 2017 to 2018 (in %)	2016	2017	2018	Increas e from 2017 to 2018 (in %)
A	1,85,014	463	294	346	18%	320	373	469	26%
В	1,27,290	265	235	427	82%	315	379	710	87%
C	1,66,161	280	298	293	-2%	287	521	552	6%
D	3,46,866	647	512	536	5%	995	989	1,296	31%
E	3,93,286	329	265	291	10%	295	439	465	6%
F/N	5,29,034	614	544	623	15%	245	278	530	91%
F/S	3,60,972	322	167	241	44%	191	235	360	53%
G/N	5,99,039	499	528	665	26%	471	640	834	30%
G/S	3,77,749	383	266	321	21%	252	319	547	71%
H/E	5,57,239	495	401	471	17%	603	662	856	29%
H/W	3,07,581	480	404	577	43%	664	736	1,027	40%
K/E	8,23,885	1,135	1,018	1,253	23%	903	1,057	1,353	28%
K/W	7,48,688	1,144	1,363	1,131	-17%	1,477	1,732	2,072	20%
L	9,02,225	854	607	593	-2%	1,184	1,457	1,620	11%
M/E	8,07,720	374	336	466	39%	325	484	691	43%
M/W	4,11,893	356	396	442	12%	514	923	1,164	26%
N	6,22,853	684	540	795	47%	376	999	1,161	16%
P/N	9,41,366	801	837	855	2%	585	683	871	28%
P/S	4,63,507	691	392	527	34%	411	440	792	80%
R/C	5,62,162	694	556	630	13%	597	742	983	32%
R/N	4,31,368	266	225	247	10%	203	242	330	36%
R/S	6,91,229	857	615	614	0%	540	547	627	15%
S	7,43,783	464	446	671	50%	318	631	820	30%
Т	3,41,463	378	361	443	23%	198	432	511	18%
Total	1,24,42,373	13,475	11,606	13,458	16%	12,269	15,940	20,641	29%

#### Table 19: Ward-wise Top Civic Complaints for the Calendar Years 2016 to 2018

- F/N ward had the highest increase in complaints related to 'Drainage' from 2017 to 2018, showing a 91% increase.
- K/W and K/E are the top two wards for complaints related to 'Roads' in 2018 (1,131 and 1,253 respectively).
- Overall, complaints related "Road" and "Drainage" issues have increased by 16% and 29% respectively from 2017 to 2018.



	-	-	S	WM			Wate	r Supply	
Ward	Population 2011	2016	2017	2018	Increase from 2017 to 2018 (in %)	2016	2017	2018	Increase from 2017 to 2018 (in %)
А	1,85,014	256	228	265	16%	107	120	205	71%
В	1,27,290	182	205	312	52%	83	144	151	5%
С	1,66,161	270	498	730	47%	121	254	342	35%
D	3,46,866	478	524	675	29%	290	291	352	21%
E	3,93,286	551	474	830	75%	242	234	355	52%
F/N	5,29,034	212	397	531	34%	187	177	407	130%
F/S	3,60,972	139	213	268	26%	113	95	257	171%
G/N	5,99,039	310	506	542	7%	304	250	497	99%
G/S	3,77,749	186	320	399	25%	95	101	213	111%
H/E	5,57,239	228	307	429	40%	147	188	348	85%
H/W	3,07,581	381	501	661	32%	202	229	479	109%
K/E	8,23,885	409	588	934	59%	474	486	1,266	160%
K/W	7,48,688	441	691	960	39%	541	563	1,157	106%
L	9,02,225	454	513	596	16%	620	706	947	34%
M/E	8,07,720	217	332	463	39%	1,061	544	826	52%
M/W	4,11,893	288	306	459	50%	372	291	482	66%
N	6,22,853	350	551	890	62%	365	335	601	79%
P/N	9,41,366	328	557	880	58%	509	449	890	98%
P/S	4,63,507	327	439	845	92%	267	233	393	69%
R/C	5,62,162	477	672	788	17%	346	372	606	63%
R/N	4,31,368	96	142	247	74%	96	133	230	73%
R/S	6,91,229	336	478	721	51%	289	292	774	165%
S	7,43,783	284	482	762	58%	290	342	590	73%
Т	3,41,463	130	220	307	40%	125	130	279	115%
Total	1,24,42,373	7,330	10,144	14,494	43%	7,246	6,959	12,647	82%

#### Table 20: Ward-wise Top Civic Complaints for the Calendar Years 2016 to 2018

- P/S Ward recorded the highest percentage increase in complaints related to "Solid Waste Management" (92%) from 2017 to 2018.
- Complaints related to 'Solid Waste Management' have seen an overall increase of 43% from 2017 to 2018 and complaints related to 'Water Supply' also showed a sharp increase of 82% from 2017 to 2018.
- F/S ward saw an increase of 171% from 2017 to 2018 in complaints related to 'Water Supply'.



	Roads													
	Population		ches / Po the Roa			nicipal L ' Footpat		Resu	urfacing of I	Road				
Ward	2011	2016	2017	2018	2016	2017	2018	2016	2017	2018				
A	1,85,014	174	100	125	190	90	67	27	39	59				
В	1,27,290	80	50	101	103	124	208	27	22	59				
C	1,66,161	130	70	73	63	117	118	15	69	35				
D	3,46,866	274	172	168	118	132	135	103	76	128				
E	3,93,286	123	68	93	68	73	63	39	41	48				
F/N	5,29,034	200	139	270	89	58	137	19	56	46				
F/S	3,60,972	140	49	85	67	45	58	25	19	16				
G/N	5,99,039	177	102	141	146	173	252	30	69	63				
G/S	3,77,749	183	66	94	79	98	85	29	27	30				
H/E	5,57,239	225	153	216	134	92	131	36	45	37				
H/W	3,07,581	226	127	235	89	100	138	30	55	48				
K/E	8,23,885	611	424	641	178	265	218	67	91	78				
K/W	7,48,688	567	718	470	261	262	270	59	108	97				
L	9,02,225	326	175	181	171	161	157	110	51	45				
M/E	8,07,720	181	115	182	74	64	97	13	32	29				
M/W	4,11,893	153	183	190	73	53	84	19	27	33				
N	6,22,853	238	151	256	214	168	215	44	40	75				
P/N	9,41,366	409	388	345	140	143	186	51	70	75				
P/S	4,63,507	325	154	188	125	47	133	55	58	52				
R/C	5,62,162	261	169	205	135	110	144	55	56	45				
R/N	4,31,368	119	81	77	58	48	65	23	29	26				
R/S	6,91,229	371	264	191	84	107	171	54	71	50				
S	7,43,783	221	150	254	68	108	144	32	36	69				
Т	3,41,463	127	96	137	96	83	98	47	52	38				
Total	1,24,42,373	5,841	4,164	4,918	2,823	2,721	3,374	1,009	1,239	1,281				

#### Table 21: Ward-wise Top Three Road Related Civic Complaints for the Years 2016 to 2018

#### Inference:

• Overall, there is a 27% increase in number of complaints related to 'Resurfacing of road' from 2016 to 2018. This can be attributed to the amount of work taken up in the city due to the development of the Metro line.



	Drainage												
Ward	Population 2011		ige Choke Blockages		Overf	lowing d manhole		•	nent of Iged Ma	Missing / nhole			
	2011	2016	2017	2018	2016	2017	2018	2016	2017	2018			
Α	1,85,014	159	183	243	110	140	134	19	24	68			
В	1,27,290	172	171	372	108	169	203	11	14	60			
С	1,66,161	141	313	355	101	150	126	9	27	42			
D	3,46,866	574	416	618	337	483	520	55	47	98			
E	3,93,286	169	233	246	83	153	125	21	27	56			
F/N	5,29,034	137	133	284	68	93	127	24	28	86			
F/S	3,60,972	110	117	187	59	72	89	10	21	66			
G/N	5,99,039	244	315	413	147	208	183	24	63	165			
G/S	3,77,749	146	182	300	80	91	145	8	24	62			
H/E	5,57,239	458	477	611	89	128	134	16	27	74			
H/W	3,07,581	480	487	671	103	157	166	35	49	142			
K/E	8,23,885	553	576	762	204	286	244	55	88	253			
K/W	7,48,688	1,112	1,216	1,508	212	351	305	77	79	173			
L	9,02,225	498	751	1,007	433	447	348	65	78	124			
M/E	8,07,720	157	285	352	92	108	160	16	28	98			
M/W	4,11,893	216	541	743	141	243	227	28	47	97			
N	6,22,853	201	647	784	109	224	209	17	36	94			
P/N	9,41,366	322	344	418	161	177	203	18	55	156			
P/S	4,63,507	233	262	434	105	101	165	27	34	133			
R/C	5,62,162	404	544	677	73	109	145	52	40	103			
R/N	4,31,368	129	131	223	38	53	34	10	17	35			
R/S	6,91,229	323	289	398	105	121	73	30	50	98			
S	7,43,783	157	370	454	96	171	143	20	31	137			
Т	3,41,463	104	273	343	53	111	82	10	23	49			
Total	1,24,42,373	7,199	9,256	12,403	3,107	4,346	4,290	657	957	2,469			

#### Table 22: Ward-wise Top Three Drainage Related Civic Complaints in the Years 2016 to 2018

- 'Drainage Chokes and Blockages' and 'Overflowing drains of manholes' has seen an increase of 72% and 38% from 2016 to 2018 respectively.
- K/W has recorded the highest number (1,508) of 'Drainage Chokes and Blockages' complaints in 2018, accounting up to 12% of the total registered complaints of 'Drainage Chokes and Blockages' in 2018.
- D ward recorded the highest number (520) of 'Overflowing drains of manholes' complaints in 2018. This has consistently been the case for 2017 as well.
- Complaints related to 'Replacement of Missing/ Damaged Manhole' saw a 276% increase from 2016 to 2018, which is a dramatic increase. K/E saw the most number of complaints related to this issue, accounting for 10% for the total complaints related to the issue in 2018.



# Table 23: Ward-wise Top Three Solid Waste Management Related Civic Complaints in the Years2016 to 2018

			Soli	d Waste N	Manager	nent (SW	M)			
Ward	Population 2011	House Market co	ge not lifte /Gully/ Mu /Road/ Au ollection po		noval of E			Lifting of Tree Cutting		
		2016	2017	2018	2016	2017	2018	2016	2017	2018
А	1,85,014	126	84	101	26	28	42	15	9	28
В	1,27,290	77	110	129	24	30	38	9	4	37
С	1,66,161	140	299	463	35	72	101	1	6	11
D	3,46,866	214	231	277	100	84	138	54	56	48
E	3,93,286	152	155	274	102	101	112	7	13	47
F/N	5,29,034	51	140	193	53	78	94	7	15	44
F/S	3,60,972	30	71	83	31	42	50	18	13	35
G/N	5,99,039	94	141	155	44	105	105	21	39	51
G/S	3,77,749	39	118	85	33	67	101	18	35	35
H/E	5,57,239	57	83	150	57	51	75	10	28	27
H/W	3,07,581	124	180	222	67	98	131	77	68	95
K/E	8,23,885	95	184	252	84	90	165	48	33	95
K/W	7,48,688	102	189	295	60	130	172	47	75	78
L	9,02,225	146	214	237	69	68	92	11	19	44
M/E	8,07,720	46	100	152	35	48	48	15	35	33
M/W	4,11,893	61	94	135	31	47	55	41	41	64
Ν	6,22,853	77	182	331	48	82	135	37	33	58
P/N	9,41,366	80	222	332	49	88	95	33	35	57
P/S	4,63,507	84	134	339	58	57	71	29	42	98
R/C	5,62,162	103	225	271	82	62	65	70	74	80
R/N	4,31,368	23	43	66	14	24	20	17	17	30
R/S	6,91,229	94	170	240	53	54	72	28	32	40
S	7,43,783	67	157	279	61	96	117	12	32	43
Т	3,41,463	27	71	96	25	23	28	10	40	63
Total	1,24,42,373	2,109	3,597	5,157	1,241	1,625	2,122	635	794	1,241

- C Ward has the highest number of complaints related to "Garbage not lifted from House/Gully/ Municipal Market/Road/ Authorised collection point" with 463 Complaints registered in 2018.
- "Garbage not lifted from House/Gully/ Municipal Market/Road/ Authorised collection point" complaints increased by 145% from 2016 to 2018.



	Water Supply												
Ward	Population 2011	Short	tage of Supply		Leaks	in Wate	er Lines	Unauthorised Tapping of Water Connection			Contaminated Water Supply		
	2011	2016	2017	2018	2016	2017	2018	2016	2017	2018	2016	2017	2018
А	1,85,014	26	45	99	11	7	38	19	14	14	9	33	21
В	1,27,290	27	73	77	6	3	15	13	14	20	28	45	25
С	1,66,161	56	111	138	5	23	40	10	6	25	35	90	82
D	3,46,866	102	123	120	66	59	102	17	11	21	53	55	43
E	3,93,286	60	68	117	32	31	97	35	40	33	88	68	69
F/N	5,29,034	72	65	93	21	30	121	26	27	64	17	16	38
F/S	3,60,972	26	18	115	17	24	57	35	22	19	8	14	24
G/N	5,99,039	52	42	75	29	33	152	121	82	145	50	46	50
G/S	3,77,749	21	29	32	26	18	84	17	24	39	10	17	11
H/E	5,57,239	30	38	89	29	34	123	26	35	27	31	59	41
H/W	3,07,581	61	84	147	31	42	180	19	20	24	46	57	42
K/E	8,23,885	185	204	362	103	99	535	64	56	78	46	46	64
K/W	7,48,688	220	193	333	78	64	322	71	94	224	102	121	136
L	9,02,225	129	175	150	199	135	447	143	187	130	42	73	47
M/E	8,07,720	668	217	272	117	85	281	54	55	71	38	68	68
M/W	4,11,893	118	79	130	105	65	177	37	32	67	41	63	29
N	6,22,853	51	59	86	191	158	309	33	27	58	12	18	43
P/N	9,41,366	139	153	243	83	58	293	104	60	81	88	94	113
P/S	4,63,507	110	83	114	51	41	140	29	30	25	33	34	36
R/C	5,62,162	136	146	163	26	52	236	28	15	11	100	100	68
R/N	4,31,368	28	42	66	12	17	73	10	11	18	16	25	28
R/S	6,91,229	97	131	347	42	59	223	27	25	55	64	32	51
S	7,43,783	52	53	75	113	139	301	34	46	49	15	27	19
Т	3,41,463	25	22	34	43	57	145	4	6	10	8	6	8
Total	1,24,42,373	2,491	2,253	3,477	1,436	1,333	4,491	976	939	1,308	980	1,207	1,156

#### Table 24: Top Four Water Supply Related Ward-wise Civic Complaints in the Years 2016 to 2018

- "Leaks in Water Lines" registered a sharp increase of 237% from 2017 to 2018, after a decrease of 7% from 2016 to 2017. "Contaminated Water Supply" has increased by 18% from 2016 to 2018.
- K/W ward contributed almost 17% to the total complaints registered for "Unauthorized Tapping of Water Connection" in 2018.
- L ward has also consistently had the most number of complaints registered related to "Unauthorized Tapping of Water Connection" over three years (2016, 2017, 2018).



#### Table 25: Ward-wise Average Number of Days for Closing Complaints in the Year 2018

Complaint to be attended as per Citizens' Charter	Drainag e Chokes and Blockag es	Overfl owing drains or manh oles	Odour ( Foul Smell ) from Drains	Replace ment of Missing / Damag ed Manhol e	Raising of Manhol e ( except in Monso on )	Cleani ng of septic tank	Repairs to pipe sewers/ main sewers	Contami nated Water Supply	Leaks in Wate r Lines
To resolved as per Citizens' Charter	1	1	1	1	7	7	7	1	7
Actual time taken to resolve in 2018	25	53	49	58	43	71	56	38	47
A	67	84	85	74	286	77	83	16	18
В	24	44	21	36	0	14	20	7	4
C	14	20	9	14	40	28	12	6	5
D	10	12	14	40	58	8	6	7	4
E	7	11	12	12	0	6	20	26	25
F/N	14	20	8	25	0	32	28	9	10
F/S	10	14	95	28	0	25	25	16	38
G/N	3	6	13	8	14	1	12	11	10
G/S	14	24	26	40	29	21	39	42	43
H/E	9	29	13	23	0	37	26	26	31
H/W	6	14	25	13	9	8	16	13	13
K/E	45	95	78	94	0	87	99	17	20
K/W	18	67	70	60	86	63	70	34	33
L	67	163	190	156	0	183	154	107	153
M/E	14	15	23	16	18	22	17	147	98
M/W	11	23	19	27	22	27	24	96	69
N	9	18	21	15	6	18	17	17	8
P/N	102	168	162	182	0	152	183	37	44
P/S	25	54	31	98	0	92	42	35	30
R/C	21	100	34	117	50	59	82	76	107
R/N	16	57	46	71	0	13	56	18	12
R/S	27	42	22	52	0	49	33	63	61
S	21	47	32	59	148	58	68	25	18
Т	5	14	24	46	0	0	26	14	14

- On an average, A ward took 286 days to resolve complaints related to 'Raising of Manholes', which was the most number of days taken to resolve this complaint.
- 'Cleaning of septic tank' took the highest average number of days to be closed in 2018 (71 days).



Complaint to be attended as per Citizens' Charter To resolved as per	Shorta ge of Water Supply	Burst Wate r Main	Garbag e not lifted - Co- authori sed Point	Collectio n point not attended properly	Garbage lorry not reported for service/ Lorry not covered	Provid ing/re movin g/repl acing dustbi ns	Swe epin g of road	Rem oval of Dea d Ani mals	Non- attend ance at public toilets
Citizens' Charter	2	1	1	1	1	8	1	1	2
Actual time taken to resolve in 2018	40	47	35	37	35	40	33	33	39
A	18	21	41	60	64	44	41	51	0
В	3	0	6	7	3	9	7	6	2
С	5	6	21	31	13	12	11	16	0
D	4	3	41	49	46	65	45	53	38
E	25	18	13	14	12	15	14	8	14
F/N	8	10	9	10	8	11	11	5	15
F/S	21	37	20	20	13	20	21	16	22
G/N	10	8	61	19	6	63	55	77	2
G/S	40	47	31	37	25	44	37	22	42
H/E	36	41	22	27	23	21	20	26	27
H/W	13	14	5	5	5	5	5	4	4
K/E	18	18	24	20	19	22	33	18	18
K/W	26	32	32	33	35	36	38	34	82
L	169	147	146	169	139	123	154	127	156
M/E	107	122	43	50	40	56	37	36	37
M/W	76	79	28	27	25	39	25	28	36
N	10	7	5	4	3	6	4	6	6
P/N	39	53	123	120	125	114	91	93	57
P/S	34	25	15	17	15	17	21	16	34
R/C	101	109	51	47	33	88	41	37	79
R/N	14	8	96	44	48	63	103	54	61
R/S	42	44	8	14	5	21	10	5	7
S	20	18	38	28	37	45	32	46	34
Т	16	12	9	0	10	0	18	0	0

#### Inference:

• L ward took the most number of days to resolve complaints related to 'No attendance at public toilets' in 2018 (156 days).



### Section II: Analysis of Municipal Budget of 2019-20 relating to Civic Issues and Manpower Available with Municipal Corporation of Greater Mumbai<sup>6</sup>

### Revenue v/s Capital Expenditure from FY 2014-15 to 2019-20

#### Table 27: Reduction in Budget Estimates in Revenue Expenditure

Revenue Expenditure						
Financial Year	Budget Estimates	Revised Estimates	Reduction (in %)			
2014-15	20,120.73	18,966.61	6%			
2015-16	21,675.41	18,617.32	14%			
2016-17	24,172.71	18,573.69	23%			
2017-18	17,011.83	15,866.07	7%			
2018-19	17,723.25	15,717.83	11%			
2019-20	19,205.27	-	-			

#### Table 28: Reduction in Budget Estimates in Capital Expenditure

Capital Expenditure						
<b>Financial Year</b>	Budget Estimates	Revised Estimates	Reduction (in %)			
2014-15	11,051.69	7,348.08	34%			
2015-16	11,836.00	7,630.60	36%			
2016-17	12,874.78	5399.67	58%			
2017-18	8,127.08	6,111.07	25%			
2018-19	9,527.80	7,797.56	18%			
2019-20	11,480.42	-	-			

#### Table 29: Budgetary Allocation of Departments Related to Civic Issues for FY 2019-20

Department	Budget
Solid Waste Management	2,888.70
Storm Water Drains	1,302.98
Roads and Traffic	2,382.79
Water Operation	1,875.06
Water Supply Project	620.16
Sewerage Operation	621.10
Mumbai Sewerage Disposal Project	489.08
Sewerage Project Department	270.11

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> All figures are in crores unless specified otherwise. All figures have been taken from the Municipal Commissioner's speeches from 2014-15 to 2018-19, available on their website : <u>www.mcgm.gov.in</u>. 'Actuals' figures have been taken from the 'Income and Expenditure' section from the Annual Accounts tab on the MCGM website. *Note: 'RE' stands for Revenue Expenditure and 'CE' stands for Capital Expenditure*




#### Graph 3: Share of Departments in the Budget of FY 2019-20

- Departments of Solid Waste Management, Storm Water Drainage, Water Operations, Roads & Traffic, Water Supply Project, Sewerage Operation, Mumbai Sewerage Disposal Project, Sewerage Project account for 34% of the total budget allocation in 2019-20.
- Solid Waste Management Department has been allocated 9% of the total budget, whereas Roads & Traffic and Water Operations Departments have been allocated 8% of the total budget each.
- Despite most number of complaints in 2018 being related to 'Drainage' issues, Departments of Storm Water Drainage, Sewerage Operation, Mumbai Sewerage Disposal Project and Sewerage Project **together** account for 9% of the total budget.



Financial Year	Budget Estimates		Actuals			Percentage Utilised			
	RE	CE	Total	RE	CE	Total	RE	CE	Total
2014-15	652	2,831	3,483	892	2,137	3,028	137%	75%	87%
2015-16	688	3,858	4,546	871	1,894	2,765	127%	49%	61%
2016-17	705	4,479	5,184	858	549	1,406	122%	12%	27%
2017-18*	806	2,480	3,286	813	1,350	2,163	101%	54%	66%
2018-19*	848	3,270	4,118	-	-	-	-	-	-
2019-20*	881	3,821	4,702	-	-	-	-	-	-

#### Table 30: Roads, Traffic Operations & Bridges

\* - includes Coastal Road Project

#### Inference:

- In 2016-17, 73% of the Budget Estimates (overall) of Roads & Traffic Department were un-utilised. In 2017-18, there was a big improvement, with a 34% underutilisation.
- Utilisation of Revenue Expenditure has always been more than the Budget Estimates for Roads and Traffic Departments, from 2014-15 to 2017-18.

Financial Year	Budget Estimates		Actuals			Percentage Utilised			
	RE	CE	Total	RE	CE	Total	RE	CE	Total
2014-15	337	1,121	1,458	432	657	1,089	128%	59%	75%
2015-16	329	1,098	1,426	346	402	748	105%	37%	52%
2016-17	410	999	1,408	440	469	909	107%	47%	65%
2017-18	369	475	844	441	599	1,040	119%	126%	123%
2018-19	363	566	929	-	-	-	-	-	-
2019-20	478	825	1,303	-	-	-	-	-	-

#### **Table 31: Storm Water Drains Department**

#### Inference:

• Despite the dire flooding crisis in Mumbai, almost half (48%) of Budget Estimates in Storm Water Drainage Department were unutilised in 2015-16. This utilisation has drastically improved in 2017-18, with a 123% utilisation.



Financial Year	Budget Estimates		Actuals			Percentage Unutilised			
	RE	CE	Total	RE	CE	Total	RE	CE	Total
2014-15	3,245	2,881	6,127	2,059	1,136	3,195	63%	39%	52%
2015-16	3,247	2,543	5,790	2,615	1,239	3,854	81%	49%	67%
2016-17	3,328	2,559	5,887	4,038	942	4,980	121%	37%	85%
2017-18	3,215	1,611	4,826	4,559	974	5,533	142%	60%	115%
2018-19	3,513	1,787	5,300	-	-	-	-	-	-
2019-20	3,532	2,150	5,682	-	-	-	-	-	-

#### Table 32: 'G' Budget (Water & Sewerage Operations)

#### Table 33: Solid Waste Management & Transport

Financial Year	Budget Estimates		Actuals			Percentage Utilised			
	RE	CE	Total	RE	CE	Total	RE	CE	Total
2014-15	2,144	486	2,630	1,686	76	1,762	79%	16%	67%
2015-16	2,227	418	2,645	1,806	66	1,872	81%	16%	71%
2016-17	2,458	394	2,852	1,944	124	2,069	79%	32%	73%
2017-18	2,247	359	2,606	2,110	142	2,253	94%	40%	86%
2018-19*	2,456	510	2,966	-	-	-	-	-	-
2019-20*	2,709	562	3,270	-	-	-	-	-	-

\* - Includes Slum Sanitation Programme (SSP)

- The Solid Waste Management Department of the MCGM is highly respected since it picks up large quantities (7100 Metric Tonnes per day, according to the Municipal Commissioner's speech) of waste with limited resources.
- Lack of utilisation, however, plagues this department as well. On an average across three years from 2014-15 to 2017-18, the percentage of unutilised budgetary allocation was 26%.



## Section III. MCGM Manpower

## Table 34: Department-Wise MCGM Manpower as of 31<sup>st</sup> Dec 2018

<b>D</b>		Posts					
Department	Sanctioned	Available	Vacant (%)				
Municipal Secretary Department	457	304	33%				
Municipal Auditor's Department	979	564	42%				
Municipal Commissioner office	1,049	659	37%				
Auditor's Department	1,800	1,453	19%				
Security Department	4,242	2,843	33%				
Water Supply and Sewerage Department	467	396	15%				
Central Procurement Dept.	99	70	29%				
Labour Department	374	196	48%				
Public Relations Department	52	40	23%				
Mumbai Fire Brigade	4,175	3,191	24%				
Enquiry Department	118	106	10%				
Assessor and Collector Department	3,649	1,854	49%				
Legal Department	355	263	26%				
Solid Waste Management Department	35,181	28,664	19%				
Storm Water Drains Department	3,377	2,025	40%				
Mechanical & Electrical Department	1,024	572	44%				
Development Plan Department	495	342	31%				
City Engineer's Department	4,218	2,592	39%				
Water Engineer's Department	10,834	6,604	39%				
Water Supply project Department	554	243	56%				
Sewerage Propulsion Department	7,815	4,324	45%				
Sewerage Project	454	178	61%				
Civic Training Institute and Research Centre	72	56	22%				
Roads & Traffic Department	6,350	3,792	40%				
Mumbai Sewerage Project	86	50	42%				
License Department	899	757	16%				
Education Department	22,081	12,240	45%				
Garden & Recreation Department	1,639	794	52%				



		Posts				
Department	Sanctioned	Available	Vacant (%)			
Shops & Establishment Department	259	206	20%			
Municipal Printing Press	516	270	48%			
Health Department	12,533	8,530	32%			
KEM and Medical college	6,152	3,985	35%			
LT Marg and Medical college	4,830	3,214	33%			
BYL Nair and Tora Medical College	4,414	2,680	39%			
Nair Hospital Dental College	351	255	27%			
Deonar Abattoir	820	319	61%			
Development Plan Department	53	26	51%			
Estate Department	1,542	1,148	26%			
Markets Department	1,111	642	42%			
Encroachment and Elimination Department	91	81	11%			
Information and Technology Department	47	41	13%			
Suburban Hospitals	10,202	6,648	35%			
Disaster Management Cell	281	94	67%			
Bridges Department	141	85	40%			
Dr. Rustam N Kapoor Medical College	512	247	52%			
Zoo	213	97	54%			
Coastal Road Project	42	19	55%			
Building shielding	264	182	31%			
Total	1,57,269	1,03,941	34%			



## **Section IV: Functioning of Ward Committees**

#### Functioning of the Ward Committees:

'Ward Committees' are one of the most crucial mechanisms available to Municipal Councillors for conducting deliberations for delivering effective governance. Issues of prime significance to citizens' daily lives related to civic amenities such as road, water supply, drainage, etc. can be taken up and redressed effectively in this forum. Almost all civic issues are to be resolved through this mechanism. This was precisely the aim of the 74<sup>th</sup> Constitutional Amendment, which mandated the creation of the Ward Committees, to bring in grassroots democracy and strengthen it.

#### Devices for raising questions/grievances in ward committee meetings:

Councillors use various devices to enable them to know about the functioning of various committees, monitor performance of Administration and resolve citizen's problems.

1. **Short Notice Questions**: Councillors can raise civic issues and follow up on them with the Administration through Short Notice Questions. These questions should be of urgent civic importance, for instance, those causing harm to lives of citizens, such as building collapse or fire etc. Such urgent matters are admitted and the Commissioner is accountable to answer them. In cases of not to so urgent matters, the written questions are sent by the Councillors to the Assistant Commissioner, who sends answers to respective Councillors. The Short Notice Question should be specific and related to only one matter at a time and should be framed in not more than 2-3 sentences. For example, 1) Is it true that Mumbai city is severely caught up with Swine Flu? 2) How many patients are being treated in Mumbai in Kasturba and other hospitals? 3) Why has the indigenous vaccine for Swine Flu not yet been procured in Mumbai? Please give detailed information. The Short Notice Questions are not discussed in the House.

2. **Notice of Motions**: Councillors may ask for a statement to be made by the Commissioner on an urgent matter relating to the Administration by giving at least one hour notice before the meeting. The Commissioner answers the notice in writing and no discussion can be done on the answers. The Councillors may present a Notice of Motion on matters of importance and in the interest of Mumbai city. The Motion should be presented in a general form and should be in the interest of the public at large.

3. Adjournment Motion: The Councillors may bring to the notice of the House any incidences where citizens are facing severe problems due to specific reasons, and the concerned officers and ward in-charge have not taken due action despite bringing the matter to their attention. In such cases, Councillors can propose an Adjournment Motion, as a protest against the inaction of the Administration. The notice for the Adjournment Motion should be given at least half an hour before the meeting of the House. The proposal is accepted by majority vote. In case the Councillors directly present an Adjournment Motion in the House without prior notice, then it is treated as a Simplicitor, which is not discussed in the House and passed only with unanimous voting.

4. **Amendments proposed**: When a Councillor has any objection about a topic on the meeting agenda, if s/he thinks it is inadequate, s/he can present a notice to the Administrative office for Amendment in order to reconsider the topic. If a Councillor wants to present an Amendment, it is customary that s/he is allowed to speak first.



5. **Proposal raised/agenda raised/ letter to raise issues**: When a Councillor wants to raise any agenda or question, s/he writes a letter for the same, following which it appears in the agenda for discussion in the meeting.

6. **Point of Orders**: The Councillor, in order to bring any serious incident in his/her constituency to the notice of the House, can raise a Point of Order. There are specific rules on when and how the Point of Order can be raised apart from precedents. The Point of Order can be raised while a subject is being discussed in the house, provided it is related to that subject. The Committee Chairperson has a right to decide whether or not to allow a discussion on the Point of Order and announces the decision on the Point of Order. In case the information provided is inadequate to reach a decision, it is presented in the subsequent meeting. The decision by the Ward Committee Chairperson is deemed final and in cases of disagreements, it can only be challenged in the Court.

Source: Corporation Procedure Rules and Regulation Mumbai: Municipal Printing Press, 2001.

Ward Committee								
Year Total Meeting Attendance in (%) Total Questions								
Mar'17 to Dec'17	240	82%	856					
Jan'18 to Dec'18	279	79%	1,046					

#### Table 35: Total number of Meetings, Attendance and Questions Asked in Ward Committees

#### Inference:

- The attendance in Ward Committees of the newly elected councillors in 2017 was 82%. The number of meetings in 2017 was 240 whereas it increased to 279 in 2018. Attendance of Councillors in 2018 fell to 79% as compared to 82% in 2017.
- Number of questions asked in ward committees in 2018 is 1,046. Number of questions asked by new councillors of 2017 in their first year was 856.

#### Table 36: Number of Questions Asked by Councillors in Ward Committees

Catagory	No. of Members					
Category	Mar'17 to Dec'17	Jan'18 to Dec'18				
Zero Question	38	31				
1 to 5 Question asked	134	122				
6 to 10 Question asked	46	53				
Above 10 Question asked	10	21				
Total Members	228*	227				

\* - Shailaja Girkar was elected in March 2017 but passed away in September 2017, and Pratibha Girkar was elected in her place. Shailaja Girkar's questions till August 2017 have been considered. Hence, the number of councillors has been shown as 228 and not 227.

- Maximum number of councillors asked between 1 to 5 questions in 2018 (122 Councillors).
- 31 councillors have not asked a single question in 2018. This is lower than the 2017 figure of 38.
- 21 councillors asked more than 10 questions in 2018 as compared to 10 councillors in 2017.





Graph 4: Types of Devices Used by Councillors in the Year 2018 (January to December)

- Point of Order has been, by far the most frequently used device by Councillors in 2018(748 times).
- The 'Short Notice Questions' device has only been used 3 times, even lesser than Adjournment of meeting device (20 times) in 2018.

Table 37: : Types of Devices Used by Councillors from March 2017 to December 2018

Types of devices	Mar '17 to Dec '17	Jan '18 to Dec '18
Adjournment of meeting	8	20
Agenda raised (letter)	257	275
Amendment Proposed	0	0
Point of order	588	748
Short Notice Questions	0	3
Notice of Motion	3	0
Total	856	1,046



## Graph 5: Answers Given by Administration to Point of Order Questions Raised in Ward committee Meetings



Note: Pending questions from previous years have been added to the current years, since those questions are still pending. Hence, the 'Pending Questions' figures are progressive in nature.

#### Inference:

• Total Number of Pending Questions has escalated every year, from 345 questions in 2014 to 1,010 questions in 2017, and then dropping to 919 pending questions in 2018.

It is important to understand that Point of Order questions are questions which relate to serious issues. The Ward Committee needs to take a serious stand in answering the questions which in turn will result in better functioning of the government. So many questions left unanswered over the years, shows poor governance and ignorance from the Administration. Hence, it is essential for smooth functioning that the question, however trivial in nature, be addressed and answered to infer further solutions in policy making.





#### Graph 6: Comparison of the Average Days Taken to Answer Point of Order Questions in the Ward Committees from 2014 to 2018

- A delay in answers to Point of Order Questions affects time-bound service delivery to citizens since the administration is not held accountable. Even in 2018, it took 61 days on an average to answer a Point of Order question.
- A greater emphasis should be put on the administration, so that they start answering Point of Order questions in a specified time-frame.
- To the administration's credit, the average number of days to answer Point of Order questions has steadily decreased from 374 days in 2014 to 61 days in 2018.



## Table 38: Top Three Wards in Complaints and Questions in Proportion to the Ward Population inthe Year 2018

Top three Ward in complaints		H/E	M/E	R/N
Population 2011		5,57,239	8,07,720	4,31,368
No. of Councillor		10	15	8
Total Complaints		3,518	4,232	2,171
Road	Complaints	471	466	247
	Question asked	3	8	11
Drainage	Complaints	856	691	330
Dramage	Question asked	3	0	0
SWM	Complaints	429	463	247
300101	Question asked	2	3	5
Total Question		34	31	48
Naming/Renaming of R	oads	7	3	4

#### Inference:

- H/E (3,518), M/E (4,232) and R/N (2,171) are the top three wards with the highest number of complaints in proportion to their population.
- Despite 429, 463, and 247 complaints being registered on SWM in H/E, M/E and R/N wards respectively, only 2, 3 and 5 questions have been asked on the same issue by Councillors in 2018.
- Despite M/E and R/N wards having a high number of complaints related to 'Drainage', no questions have been asked by councillors on the same issue.

#### Table 39: Top Three Wards in Complaints and Its Number of Questions in the Year 2018

Top three wards in complaints		K/E	к/w	L
No. of Councillors		15	13	16
<b>Total Complaints</b>		8,146	9,465	7,242
	Complaints	1,253	1,131	593
Road	Questions asked	11	23	21
Drainage	Complaints	1,353	2,072	1,620
Dramage	Questions asked	3	6	2
SWM	Complaints	934	960	596
500101	Questions asked	3	9	10
Total Questions		70	109	93
Naming/Renaming	of Roads	3	17	15

- K/E (8,146), K/W (9,465) and L (7,242) were the top three wards in terms of number of complaints in 2018.
- In spite of having highest number of complaints for drainage issue councillors have asked comparatively less questions on this issue.



# Table 40: Top Three Wards in Questions Asked in Proportion to the Number of Councillors Electedfrom the Ward in the Year 2018

Top three ward in total question	G/S	K/W	M/W					
No. of councillor	7	13	7					
Total Question	92	109	63					
Question asked on following issue	Question asked on following issues							
Roads	32	23	10					
Drainage	7	6	6					
SWM	4	9	4					
Naming/Renaming of Roads	2	17	6					
Total Complaints	3,160	9,465	4,331					

- G/S (92), K/W (109), and M/W (63) are the top three wards for questions asked in proportion to the number of Councillors.
- Among the top three wards, Councillors of G/S have asked more questions related to Roads, Drainage and Solid Waste Management.



## Table 41: Issue-wise Questions Asked by Councillors during the period January 2018 to December 2018

Sr. No.	Ward	Drai nag e	SW M	Wat er Sup ply	Lice nse	Roa ds	Gar den	Comm unity Develo pment	Hea lth	Educ ation	Nami ng/ Rena ming of Road	Other issues relate d	Total
1	Ward Committee	A, B ai	nd E										
	A	0	0	5	0	1	0	0	0	0	6	0	12
	В	0	0	1	0	1	0	1	0	0	2	0	5
	E	2	1	3	0	7	0	0	3	0	3	6	25
2	Ward Committee	C and	D	T	r	r	[	1	r	[	r	r	
	С	0	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	3	0	4
	D	0	2	0	0	3	0	2	0	0	5	7	19
3	Ward Committee	F/Sou	th and	F/Nor							1		
	F/N	0	0	3	7	5	0	1	1	0	6	12	35
	F/S	0	3	1	2	5	0	0	0	0	8	7	26
4	Ward Committee G/North	1	4	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	3	4	12
5	Ward Committee G/South	7	4	3	3	32	6	8	3	2	2	22	92
6	Ward Committee	H/East	t and H	H/Wes	t								
	H/E	3	2	1	2	3	0	1	1	0	7	14	34
	H/W	3	2	0	8	3	1	0	0	0	7	4	28
7	Ward Committee K/East	3	3	1	6	11	1	4	1	2	3	35	70
8	Ward Committee K/West	6	9	7	8	23	0	5	1	1	17	32	109
9	Ward Committee L	2	10	11	7	21	0	3	2	0	15	22	93
10	Ward Committee M/E	0	3	3	2	8	1	1	1	1	3	8	31
11	Ward Committee M/W	6	4	4	3	10	2	4	2	0	6	22	63
12	Ward Committee N	1	5	1	3	5	1	1	0	0	5	9	31
13	Ward Committee P/North	3	15	5	17	27	2	6	1	3	14	19	112
14	Ward Committee P/South	0	3	3	0	6	1	1	3	0	9	6	32



Sr. No.	Ward	Drai nag e	SW M	Wat er Sup ply	Lice nse	Roa ds	Gar den	Comm unity Develo pment	Hea lth	Educ ation	Nami ng/ Rena ming of Road	Other issues relate d	Total
15	Ward Committee	R/Cen	tral an	nd R/N	orth								
	R/C	6	5	4	8	10	1	2	3	0	2	15	56
	R/N	0	5	5	4	11	3	3	0	0	4	13	48
16	Ward Committee R/South	3	3	3	2	11	2	4	6	2	6	18	60
17	Ward Committee	S and	т										
	S	0	2	3	2	2	0	0	0	1	15	6	31
	Т	1	0	0	1	3	0	1	1	1	7	3	18
	Total	47	86	67	85	208	21	48	29	13	158	284	1,046

- Maximum number of questions were asked on 'Roads' (208), followed by 'Naming/Renaming of Roads (158).
- Lowest (4) number of questions were asked in C ward, while highest number of questions (112) were asked in P/N Ward Committee.



## Section V. Analysis of Political Party Manifestos

When political parties make certain promises in election manifestos, it is expected that they would have put some thought into those issues in the years leading up to the election. If parties made an effort to raise these issues in the period before the elections, then it indicates a sincerity towards the causes they espouse. It also indicates a coherent thinking process of the parties.

The most objective way of analysing this is by comparing the promises in the manifestos with the questions asked by the councillors in the corporation and its various committees. For this, we collated all the promises made by major political parties in their manifestos and divided them into several broad categories. Not all parties have necessarily asked questions related to all of these categories. Within these categories, we have compared specific issues raised by the parties in their manifestos with questions raised by them in the preceding years. Thus, we have restricted our analysis to these sub-issues rather than focusing on broader issues.

In our analysis we have compared Issues in Political Party Manifestos for 2017 MCGM elections and Questions asked by respective Party Councillors during March 2017 to December 2017. We have given the benefit of doubt to political parties while comparing issues mentioned in the manifestos with questions raised earlier. For example, if completion of the Gargai project was listed as an issue in the manifesto, questions related to increased water supply were taken as being related to this issue, even if the questions were not specifically about the project. This is because although the completion of the project is a specific issue, it is linked to the broader question of adequate water supply.

We are going to track this section every year in our civic issues report henceforth to see whether the newly elected councillors are raising any of the issues that their respective political parties have mentioned in their manifestos.

Note: The party-wise points and sub-points are given in the Annexure (page 78) of this report.



# Table 42: Party Wise Summary of Manifesto Points and Questions Raised from March 2018 toDecember 2018

	Political Party - No of Questions								
Manifesto Points	Bhartiya Janta Party (83 Councillors)		-	ncillors)	Indian National Congress (30 Councillors)		Congres ( 9 Coun	National Congress Party ( 9 Councillors)	
	Mar'17	Jan'18	Mar'17	Jan'18	Mar'17	Jan'18	Mar'17	Jan'18	
	to	to	to	to	to	to	to	to	
	Dec'17	Dec'18	Dec'17	Dec'18	Dec'17	Dec'18	Dec'17	Dec'18	
Affordable houses	9	14	0	0	0	2	0	0	
Best Transport	6	4	4	11	2	7	0	0	
Development Plan	18	40	9	6	0	15	0	0	
Disaster Management	0	0	1	0	0	0	1	0	
Fire Brigade	2	3	0	7	0	3	0	0	
Flood	2	8	2	12	0	1	0	0	
Holistic Development	4	3			1	IA			
Municipal Hospital	7	22	8	8	4	6	10	3	
Municipal School Education	18	17	1	5	3	7	2	2	
New Road Project	14	57	0	5	0	7	2	0	
Open Spaces	39	41	5	4	3	12	0	3	
Planning of Hawker and Peddlers	23	25	5	3	4	12	0	0	
Potholes	4	8	5	10	1	11	0	0	
Property Tax	6	1	4	2	0	1	0	0	
Public Health	9	14	13	12	0	9	4	3	
Road Tendering	3	6	1	1	0	3	0	0	
Sanitation	4	16	7	4	1	2	2	0	
Sewerage	15	13	5	3	3	9	1	1	
Social culture/ Tourism / Encouragement to Mumbai Tourism / Monuments Of The Great Personalities/Marathi Pride	1	19	4	13	0	3	1	0	
Solid Waste Management (SWM)	31	28	9	3	4	15	0	2	
Subsidized Meals		N	A	•	0	0	0	0	
Traffic Management	6	13	4	1	0	9	0	1	
Transparent administration/Tendering Contactor/Citizen Participation	19	41	N	A	0	17	NA	A	
Water Supply	20	24	7	5	7	15	0	3	
Women, children, youth & Welfare of youth / Senior citizens	12	30	10	5	2	6	0	3	
Total	272	447	104	120	34	172	23	21	



## Section VI: Open Defecation Free (ODF) status given to Greater Mumbai

The Ministry of Urban Development, Government of India has come out with a document<sup>7</sup> titled 'Declaring your City/Town ODF: A ready reckoner', which lists out a thorough procedure for Urban Local Bodies (ULBs) to declare their cities as Open Defecation Free (ODF). In this document, an ODF city/ward is defined as:

A city / ward can be notified/declared as ODF city/ ODF ward if, at any point of the day, not a single person is found defecating in the open.

Under this definition, necessary conditions that are mandated to be achieved before declaring a city as ODF are:

- All households that have space to construct toilet, have constructed one.
- All occupants of those households that do not have space to construct toilet have access to a community toilet within a distance of 500 meters.
- All commercial areas have public toilets within a distance of 1 kilometer.
- City has a mechanism in place through which fines are imposed fine on people found defecating in the open.

Under the 'Swachh Certificate for Open Defecation Free Status'<sup>8</sup> banner, Greater Mumbai has been declared 100% Open Defecation Free (ODF) as of 18-08-2018.

Though neither the ULB nor the Urban Development Ministry has released data pertaining to the above conditions being met, we obtained data on Public and Community Toilets, and checked if Mumbai does indeed have the necessary infrastructure to support the conditions and definition mentioned above.

Note: The MCGM maintains two types of toilets; Public (Pay & Use) toilets and Community toilets. Community toilets are built by the MCGM/State Agency and handed over to a community/slum under a CBO (Community Based Organisation).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> <u>https://smartnet.niua.org/sites/default/files/resources/ODF%20Declaration%20booklet.pdf</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> <u>http://sbmodf.in/?metric=ALL&state=maharashtra&city=greater%20mumbai</u>



Ward / Zone	Population	Ladies	Gents	Differently Abled (Handicapped)	Disparity (between Male and Female toilets)
Α	1,85,014	102	449	17	77%
В	1,27,290	92	377	18	76%
С	1,66,161	55	356	9	85%
D	3,46,866	79	327	17	76%
E	3,93,286	105	435	45	76%
F/N	5,29,034	130	388	12	66%
F/S	3,60,972	155	517	1	70%
G/N	5,99,039	675	1,507	21	55%
G/S	3,77,749	106	406	4	74%
H/E	5,57,239	95	277	0	66%
H/W	3,07,581	70	243	7	71%
K/E	8,23,885	98	258	1	62%
K/W	7,48,688	162	467	3	65%
L	9,02,225	104	292	10	64%
M/E	8,07,720	267	631	5	58%
M/W	4,11,893	135	327	12	59%
Ν	6,22,853	98	331	0	70%
P/N	9,41,366	101	328	32	69%
P/S	4,63,507	54	184	9	71%
R/C	5,62,162	96	255	6	62%
R/N	4,31,368	170	340	8	50%
R/S	6,91,229	95	315	0	70%
S	7,43,783	103	325	1	68%
т	3,41,463	90	311	4	71%
City Zone total	30,85,411	1,499	4,762	144	69%
Western Suburbs	55,27,025	941	2,667	66	65%
Eastern Suburbs	38,29,937	797	2,217	32	64%
Total	1,24,42,373	3,237	9,646	242	66%

#### Table 43: Number of Pay & Use Toilets in Greater Mumbai as of 31st December 2018

- The disparity between number of toilets for Males and number of toilets for Females is shocking in Mumbai.
- C ward has the largest disparity with 85%, while R/N ward has the lowest disparity of 50%.
- H/E, R/S and N wards also has no provision for differently abled people to use toilets. This means that 3 entire wards in Mumbai don't have sanitation facilities for differently abled people.
- Mumbai overall has a disparity of 66%, i.e. Number of toilets for women is almost one-third of the number of toilets for men.



## Section VII: Air Quality and the Health of Mumbai

#### **AQI** Definition:

Simply put, An Air Quality Index (AQI) is defined as an overall scheme that transforms weighted values of individual air pollution related parameters (SO2, CO, visibility, etc.) into a single number or set of numbers. The result is a set of rules (i.e. set of equations) that translate parameter values into a simple form by means of numerical manipulation:



Note: This image has been taken from the 'National Air Quality Index' Report released by the Central Pollution Control Board (2014)

Colour	Air Quality Index	AQI Range	Remark
	Good	0-50	Minimal Impact
	Satisfactory	51-100	May cause minor breathing discomfort in sensitive people
	Moderate	101-200	May make breathing difficult for people with lung diseases and cause discomfort in children, older adults and heart patients
	Poor	201-300	May make breathing difficult after prolonged exposure, and cause discomfort to people with heart diseases
	Very Poor	301-400	May cause respiratory illnesses in people on prolonged exposure. Effect may be more pronounced in those with lung and heart diseases.
	Severe	>400	May cause respiratory problems even in healthy people, and seriously impact those with lung/heart diseases. Even increased breathing during light physical activity can impact health.

Air Quality Index standards, according to the Central Pollution Control Board (CPCB)





#### Graph 7: Month-wise Average Air Quality Index (AQI) in 20189

#### Table 44: Average Month-wise AQI from April 2015 to December 2018<sup>10</sup>

Month		Average AQI	
Wonth	2016	2017	2018
January	170	186	176
February	98	168	147
March	103	126	127
April	74	97	88
May	70	66	80
June	59	55	72
July	68	78	65
August	56	51	69
September	55	71	81
October	91	107	115
November	113	136	137
December	164	152	151

- The lowest Average Monthly AQI has increased from 55 in June 2017 to 65 in July 2018. The highest Average Monthly AQI in 2018 was 176 in January 2018. This indicates a worsening of Air Quality as the years have progressed.
- January continues to remain the worst month of the year for pollution in Mumbai.
- Mumbai sees the best Air Quality in the months of June and August, which can be explained by the presence of the monsoon season, which drastically helps abate poor air quality.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Graph by Avneesh Chandra

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> All AQI data has been obtained from : <u>http://cpcb.nic.in/</u>, after approval from the Central Pollution Control Board (CPCB) through an RTI application.



RAJA.ORG

## Graph 8: Month wise Air Quality Index from Jan 2016 to Dec 2018



#### Table 45: AQI of Year-wise Best and Worst Days of 2016, 2017 and 2018

#### Inference:

• The lowest AQI (best air quality) has been consistently worsening over the years (20 in 2016, 35 in 2017, and 51 in 2018).



#### **Table 46: Comparison of Pollution Complaints**

Pollution Sub-Issues	2016	2017	2018	Increase from 2017 to 2018 (in %)
Air Pollution	153	149	193	30%
Pollution due to Chemical Effluents	51	55	84	53%
Factory Noise Pollution	0	0	0	0%
Nuisance due to Masala Mills/ Flour Mills	16	11	9	-18%
Total complaints	220	215	286	33%

- 'Air Pollution' complaints increased by 30% from 2017 to 2018, after staying constant from 2016 to 2017. This could be attributed to the heightened construction activity in the city.
- Complaints related to "Pollution due to Chemical Effluents has increased by 53% from 2017 to 2018.



## What needs to be done?

#### An Open Dashboard – Monitoring and evaluating complaints

- Data relating to complaints have been obtained by Praja Foundation through the RTI Act, from the Central Complaint Registration System (CCRS). This data should be made openly available to the citizens on the website in the form of a dashboard, so that the citizens, too, are aware of the issues that plague their city.
- This dashboard can be a simple forum for retrieving data relating to complaints registered by the citizens.
- Not only will this dashboard help citizens view complaints under the MCGM, it will also allow elected representatives and administration officials in monitoring and evaluating the corporation's performance on a real-time basis.
- This move will also be a first in a step towards Open Government Data.

#### Councillor Code – Greater accountability in addressing complaints

- The administration needs to be held accountable and answerable to the elected representatives and by extension, the citizens, in terms of complaints redressal. A way of doing that is by pin-pointing the department/official.
- While solving complaints the engineer concerned has to mention the councillor name (code) for each complaint, based on the constituency that the complaint belongs to. This is mandatory and should be filled out rigorously. In 2018, the councillor code was not filled in 76% of the cases. A greater emphasis needs to be on filling in the councillor code when complaints are registered.
- This will ensure that the complaints are compartmentalised and responsibility is pinned on a specific source responsible for solving the citizens' problems.
- This will also address the lack of accountability in the working of the civic body.

#### Citizen Feedback – Gauging citizens' happiness with the solution to their problem

- An essential for an efficient complaint system is citizen feedback which is missing currently and needs to be bought in through complaint audits.
- There exists no mechanism currently which takes in feedback from the citizens after a complaint is closed by the corporation.



#### Budgeting process – A budget prepared by the elected

- The national and state budgets are prepared and presented by their respective finance ministers, both of who fall in the deliberative (elected) wing of governments.
- At the city level, however, the budget is prepared and presented by the Municipal Commissioner, a bureaucrat and an unelected executive appointed by Chief Minister through the Urban Development Ministry.
- The elected bodies, namely the standing committee and the Corporation then just debate on it and make small modifications, following which the budget goes into effect for the financial year.
- This system is leading to a trend in which important projects are dropped without any explanation. It leads to a disconnect with the mandate given by the people, which in turn the only explanation for is a simple lack of accountability.
- This system also leads to chronic underutilisation of big budgets.
- Just like the 'power of the purse' at the national level is with the Lok Sabha, the elected House, the preparation and presentation of the budget should be a responsibility of the elected (deliberative) body of the Municipal Corporation of Greater Mumbai (MCGM).
- This will enhance transparency and accountability in the most important policy document of the year.
- Further, there needs to be a setting of some basic service-level benchmarks in terms of outcomes of the budget. A budget's core purpose is rendered moot if there is no outcome-based approach which encourages monitoring and tracking of the progress of spending.
- The MCGM needn't look far for inspiration, the Union Government has also started outcome based budgeting of schemes.



#### Annexure

## Table 47: Issues of Complaints Included in Citizen's Charter

Sr. No.	Complaint	To be resolved (in days)
1	Drainage Chokes and Blockages	1
2	Overflowing drains or manholes	1
3	Odour ( Foul Smell ) from Drains	1
4	Replacement of Missing / Damaged Manhole	1
5	Raising of Manhole ( except in Monsoon )	7
6	Cleaning of septic tank	7
7	Repairs to pipe sewers/main sewers	7
8	Contaminated Water Supply	1
9	Leaks in Water Lines	7
10	Shortage of Water Supply	2
11	Burst Water Main	1
12	Garbage not lifted - Co-authorised Point	1
13	Collection point not attended properly	1
14	Garbage lorry not reported for service/ Lorry not covered	1
15	Providing/removing/replacing dustbins	8
16	Sweeping of road	1
17	Removal of Dead Animals	1
18	No attendance at public toilets	2



## Table 48: Issue-wise Details of Complaints on Level 0 in 2018

		L	evel 0	
Issues	Total Complaints	No. of Complaints on which action was taken	Closed Complaints	Average Days
Roads	13,458	10,515	10,481	40
Buildings	21,014	13,345	13,287	76
Drainage	20,641	17,813	17,788	36
Water Supply	12,647	12,644	11,978	42
Solid Waste Management (SWM)	14,494	12,948	12,941	36
License	14,203	12,725	12,708	42
Pest control	6,703	6,542	6,541	36
Garden	2,936	2,378	2,361	66
Colony Officer	1,437	1,133	1,129	56
Storm Water Drainage	1,548	1,158	1,156	62
Shop and Establishment (S & E)	878	831	816	28
Medical Officer Health (MOH)	1,743	1,522	1,520	49
MCGM Related	877	595	594	56
Estate	588	369	315	85
Toilet	494	430	430	44
Pollution	286	160	160	76
School	58	29	29	108
Nuisance due to vagrants on municipal roads, footpaths, gardens	2,653	1,749	1,746	68
Total	1,16,658	96,886	95,980	46



## Table 49: Issue-wise Details of Complaints on Level I in 2018

		Lev	vel I	
Issues	Total Complaints	No. of Complaints on which action was taken	Closed Complaints	Average Days
Roads	13,458	0	0	0
Buildings	21,014	188	25	44
Drainage	20,641	2	2	35
Water Supply	12,647	0	0	0
Solid Waste Management (SWM)	14,494	14	3	35
License	14,203	6	5	43
Pest control	6,703	11	2	53
Garden	2,936	0	0	0
Colony Officer	1,437	2	0	0
Storm Water Drainage	1,548	0	0	0
Shop and Establishment (S & E)	878	0	0	0
Medical Officer Health (MOH)	1,743	0	0	0
MCGM Related	877	0	0	0
Estate	588	0	0	0
Toilet	494	0	0	0
Pollution	286	2	1	38
School	58	0	0	0
Nuisance due to vagrants on municipal roads, footpaths, gardens	2,653	0	0	0
Total	1,16,658	225	38	43



## Table 50: Issue-wise Details of Complaints on Level II in 2018

_		Lev	el II	
Issues	Total Complaints	No. of Complaints on which action was taken	Closed Complaints	Average Days
Roads	13,458	0	0	0
Buildings	21,014	214	13	47
Drainage	20,641	0	0	0
Water Supply	12,647	0	0	0
Solid Waste Management (SWM)	14,494	0	0	0
License	14,203	0	0	0
Pest control	6,703	0	0	0
Garden	2,936	0	0	0
Colony Officer	1,437	0	0	0
Storm Water Drainage	1,548	0	0	0
Shop and Establishment (S & E)	878	0	0	0
Medical Officer Health (MOH)	1,743	0	0	0
MCGM Related	877	0	0	0
Estate	588	0	0	0
Toilet	494	0	0	0
Pollution	286	0	0	0
School	58	0	0	0
Nuisance due to vagrants on municipal roads, footpaths, gardens	2,653	0	0	0
Total	1,16,658	214	13	47



## Table 51: Issue-wise Details of Complaints on Level III in 2018

		Leve	111	
Issues	Total Complaints	No. of Complaints on which action was taken	Closed Complaints	Average Days
Roads	13,458	0	0	0
Buildings	21,014	149	13	54
Drainage	20,641	95	5	24
Water Supply	12,647	0	0	0
Solid Waste Management (SWM)	14,494	0	0	0
License	14,203	0	0	0
Pest control	6,703	0	0	0
Garden	2,936	0	0	0
Colony Officer	1,437	0	0	0
Storm Water Drainage	1,548	10	0	0
Shop and Establishment (S & E)	878	0	0	0
Medical Officer Health (MOH)	1,743	0	0	0
MCGM Related	877	0	0	0
Estate	588	0	0	0
Toilet	494	0	0	0
Pollution	286	0	0	0
School	58	0	0	0
Nuisance due to vagrants on municipal roads, footpaths, gardens	2,653	0	0	0
Total	1,16,658	254	18	46



## Table 52: Issue-wise Details of Complaints on Level IV in 2018

		Level IV			Total Unresolved
Issues	Total Complaints	No. of Complaints on which action was taken	Closed Complaints	Average Days	Escalated Complaints
Roads	13,458	2,943	52	52	2,891
Buildings	21,014	7,118	130	132	7,488
Drainage	20,641	2,731	54	51	2,767
Water Supply	12,647	3	0	0	3
Solid Waste Management (SWM)	14,494	1,532	55	43	1,488
License	14,203	1,472	90	69	1,383
Pest control	6,703	150	17	59	142
Garden	2,936	558	32	56	526
Colony Officer	1,437	302	18	51	286
Storm Water Drainage	1,548	380	9	48	381
Shop and Establishment (S & E)	878	47	9	64	38
Medical Officer Health (MOH)	1,743	221	10	31	211
MCGM Related	877	282	3	37	279
Estate	588	219	2	222	217
Toilet	494	64	3	52	61
Pollution	286	124	1	113	124
School	58	29	0	0	29
Nuisance due to vagrants on municipal roads, footpaths, gardens	2,653	904	9	94	895
Total	1,16,658	19,079	494	77	19,209



## Table 53: Ward-wise Details of Complaints on Level 0 in 2018

		Level 0				
Ward	Total Complaints	No. of Complaints on which action was taken	Closed Complaints	Average Days		
А	2,474	2,463	2,462	59		
В	3,972	2,731	2,717	63		
С	3,696	2,631	2,621	37		
D	4,815	4,695	4,692	20		
E	4,337	4,164	4,127	21		
F/N	4,425	4,315	4,312	18		
F/S	2,369	2,311	2,307	36		
G/N	6,241	2,831	2,809	32		
G/S	3,160	2,571	2,541	34		
H/E	3,518	3,155	3,072	24		
H/W	4,763	4,716	4,714	23		
K/E	8,146	8,007	7,996	50		
K/W	9,465	9,064	9,040	52		
L	7,242	5,419	5,240	141		
M/E	4,232	3,924	3,920	55		
M/W	4,331	3,945	3,915	34		
N	6,570	6,428	6,419	17		
P/N	6,586	4,459	4,370	85		
P/S	4,855	3,717	3,655	41		
R/C	5,315	3,446	3,223	59		
R/N	2,171	1,083	1,082	66		
R/S	6,249	6,150	6,127	49		
S	5,115	3,472	3,437	41		
Т	2,611	1,189	1,182	21		
Total	1,16,658	96,886	95,980	46		



		Level I				
Ward	Total Complaints	No. of Complaints on which action was taken	Closed Complaints	Average Days		
А	2,474	1	1	38		
В	3,972	6	0	0		
С	3,696	11	0	0		
D	4,815	8	8	41		
E	4,337	24	5	35		
F/N	4,425	8	5	43		
F/S	2,369	0	0	0		
G/N	6,241	10	0	0		
G/S	3,160	0	0	0		
H/E	3,518	8	0	0		
H/W	4,763	1	0	0		
K/E	8,146	1	0	0		
K/W	9,465	18	2	53		
L	7,242	19	0	0		
M/E	4,232	8	0	0		
M/W	4,331	23	10	51		
N	6,570	7	0	0		
P/N	6,586	26	5	44		
P/S	4,855	4	0	0		
R/C	5,315	22	1	38		
R/N	2,171	6	0	0		
R/S	6,249	1	1	8		
S	5,115	12	0	0		
Т	2,611	1	0	0		
Total	1,16,658	225	38	43		



## Table 55: Ward-wise Details of Complaints on Level II in 2018

		Level II			
Ward	Total Complaints	No. of Complaints on which action was taken	Closed Complaints	Average Days	
А	2,474	0	0	0	
В	3,972	31	0	0	
C	3,696	15	0	0	
D	4,815	8	4	47	
E	4,337	7	0	0	
F/N	4,425	0	0	0	
F/S	2,369	2	2	45	
G/N	6,241	38	0	0	
G/S	3,160	0	0	0	
H/E	3,518	4	0	0	
H/W	4,763	0	0	0	
K/E	8,146	0	0	0	
K/W	9,465	11	0	0	
L	7,242	27	0	0	
M/E	4,232	6	0	0	
M/W	4,331	7	1	48	
N	6,570	6	0	0	
P/N	6,586	18	5	48	
P/S	4,855	4	0	0	
R/C	5,315	5	1	45	
R/N	2,171	7	0	0	
R/S	6,249	0	0	0	
S	5,115	14	0	0	
Т	2,611	4	0	0	
Total	1,16,658	214	13	47	



## Table 56: Ward-wise Details of Complaints on Level III in 2018

		Level III			
Ward	Total Complaints	No. of Complaints on	Closed	Average	
		which action was taken	Complaints	Days	
A	2,474	0	0	0	
В	3,972	14	0	0	
С	3,696	11	0	0	
D	4,815	7	7	55	
E	4,337	11	0	0	
F/N	4,425	19	0	0	
F/S	2,369	1	0	0	
G/N	6,241	9	0	0	
G/S	3,160	0	0	0	
H/E	3,518	11	0	0	
H/W	4,763	1	0	0	
K/E	8,146	7	0	0	
K/W	9,465	15	1	2	
L	7,242	33	0	0	
M/E	4,232	6	0	0	
M/W	4,331	7	2	50	
N	6,570	12	0	0	
P/N	6,586	32	6	53	
P/S	4,855	13	0	0	
R/C	5,315	7	0	0	
R/N	2,171	8	0	0	
R/S	6,249	4	0	0	
S	5,115	21	1	17	
Т	2,611	5	1	1	
Total	1,16,658	254	18	46	



		Level IV			
Ward	Total Complaints	No. of Complaints on which action was taken	Closed Complaints	Average Days	Unresolved Escalated Complaints
А	2,474	10	5	101	5
В	3,972	1,190	33	131	1,208
С	3,696	1,028	6	54	1,059
D	4,815	97	20	53	81
E	4,337	131	6	39	162
F/N	4,425	83	12	35	93
F/S	2,369	55	7	32	49
G/N	6,241	3,353	16	57	3,394
G/S	3,160	589	4	34	585
H/E	3,518	340	19	44	344
H/W	4,763	45	7	35	40
K/E	8,146	131	21	52	118
K/W	9,465	357	28	64	370
L	7,242	1,744	46	181	1,777
M/E	4,232	288	6	26	302
M/W	4,331	349	68	58	305
Ν	6,570	117	3	15	139
P/N	6,586	2,051	20	64	2,091
P/S	4,855	1,117	45	42	1,093
R/C	5,315	1,835	22	61	1,845
R/N	2,171	1,067	5	100	1,083
R/S	6,249	94	78	99	20
S	5,115	1,596	5	22	1,637
Т	2,611	1,412	12	33	1,409
Total	1,16,658	19,079	494	77	19,209

## Table 57: Ward-wise Details of Complaints on Level IV in 2018


# Table 58: Party-wise Number of Questions Asked by Councillors during January 2017 to December2018

Political Party Name	Total Members		Zero Question		1 to 5 Question asked		6 to 10 Question asked		Above 10 Question asked	
	2017	2018	2017	2018	2017	2018	2017	2018	2017	2018
Akhil Bharatiya Sena	1	1	0	0	1	1	0	0	0	0
All India Majlis-e-Ittehad- ul Muslimeen	2	2	1	1	1	1	0	0	0	0
Bharatiya Janata Party	84	83	10	7	55	51	18	17	1	8
Bhartiya Republican Party Bahujan Mahasangha	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Independent	4	2	0	1	4	1	0	0	0	0
Indian National Congress	30	30	7	3	13	11	6	12	4	4
Maharashtra Navnirman Sena	7	1	2	1	3	0	2	0	0	0
Nationalist Congress Party	9	9	4	2	5	6	0	1	0	0
Republican Party Of India (RPI)(A)	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Samajwadi Party	6	6	0	2	5	3	1	1	0	0
Shiv Sena	85	93	14	14	47	48	19	22	5	9
Total Members	228	227	38	31	134	122	46	53	10	21

# Table 59: Party-wise Number of Questions Asked on Civic Issues during January 2017 to December2018

Political Party Name		No. of Members		Road		Drainage		SWM	
	2017	2018	2017	2018	2017	2018	2017	2018	
Akhil Bharatiya Sena	1	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	
All India Majlis-e-Ittehad-ul Muslimeen	2	2	1	0	0	0	0	0	
Bharatiya Janata Party	84	83	44	75	12	13	24	28	
Bhartiya Republican Party Bahujan Mahasangha	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	
Independent	4	2	1	0	0	0	0	3	
Indian National Congress	30	30	18	34	8	10	12	14	
Maharashtra Navnirman Sena	7	1	4	0	0	0	1	0	
Nationalist Congress Party	9	9	5	6	0	0	0	2	
Republican Party Of India (RPI)(A)	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	
Samajwadi Party	6	6	3	3	1	1	3	1	
Shiv Sena	85	93	75	90	21	23	36	38	
Total	228	227	151	208	42	47	76	86	



# Table 60: Party-wise Number of Questions Asked on Civic Issues during January 2017 to December2018

Political Party Name		Water Supply		Naming/ Renaming of Roads / Chowk		Other related issues		Total	
	2017	2018	2017	2018	2017	2018	2017	2018	
Akhil Bharatiya Sena	0	0	0	1	1	0	1	1	
All India Majlis-e-Ittehad-ul Muslimeen	0	0	0	0	0	2	1	2	
Bharatiya Janata Party	16	20	57	73	133	157	286	366	
Bhartiya Republican Party Bahujan Mahasangha	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	
Independent	2	0	5	0	6	2	14	5	
Indian National Congress	8	12	7	16	72	97	125	183	
Maharashtra Navnirman Sena	3	0	1	0	18	0	27	0	
Nationalist Congress Party	0	3	0	3	8	12	13	26	
Republican Party Of India (RPI)(A)	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	
Samajwadi Party	2	4	0	1	11	4	20	14	
Shiv Sena	25	28	55	64	157	206	369	449	
Total	56	67	125	158	406	480	856	1046	



Table 61: List of Councillors Who Asked Zero Questions in Ward Committees from Mar 2017 to Dec2018

Name	Ward	Constituency No.	Political Party
Gulnaz Salim Qureshi	H/E	92	All India Majlis-e-Ittehad-ul Muslimeen
Jagdish Makkunny Thaivalapill	G/N	185	Shiv Sena
Kesharben Murji Patel	K/E	76	Bharatiya Janata Party
Manisha Harishchandra Rahate	S	119	Nationalist Congress Party
Rajrajeshwari Anil Redkar	S	120	Shiv Sena
Ramesh Gajanan Korgaonkar	S	114	Shiv Sena
Reshmabano Mohammadhasim Khan	G/N	188	Nationalist Congress Party
Rutuja Rhadayanath Tari	M/E	143	Shiv Sena
Sanjay Ramchandra Turde	L	166	Maharashtra Navnirman Sena
Vasant Shivram Nakashe	G/N	186	Shiv Sena
Vishakha Sharad Raut	G/N	191	Shiv Sena
Yashwant Kamlakar Jadhav	E	209	Shiv Sena



# Table 62: Bhartiya Janta Party (BJP) Manifesto

#### **Manifesto Points**

#### 1. Affordable houses (8)

Completed by 2022 under Pantpradhan Awas Scheme and house for everybody asking for; Construction of 11 lakh affordable houses to provide house to everybody in Mumbai; Slum Redevelopment Scheme, MHADA redevelopment scheme will be speeded up; Ownership house will be provided to Corporation's cleaning staff within five years; Redevelopment of B.D.D./B.I.T. Chawls and Dharavi; Section 33(7) will be made applicable to residents in dilapidated buildings in suburbs; Rehabilitation of slums near airport and slums of hill slopes; Shifting and rehabilitation of slums in C.R.Z. area.

#### 2. Best Transport (8)

To manage budgeted deficit in Best budget cross subsidy will be granted by Municipal corporation; Wi-Fi system will be installed in all bus depot and buildings of Best; Pollution free Best buses running on battery will be purchased; Five big Best terminals will be constructed in Mumbai; Multi-storied parking areas will be constructed on premises of Best depots to enhance income of Best undertaking; Considering new network of Metro bus routes will be replanned and changed; Mobile app PIS – Passenger Information System - will be developed so that passengers will know definite timing of bus service; Scheme will be prepared for Best employees preferably for best bus drivers and conductors.

#### 3. Development Plan (24)

Inclusion of development plan mandatory of the Municipality under section 61 of Municipality Act, 1888; New independent department for the strict implementation of Development Plan 2034 and erection of independent ward in every departmental office; Implementation of special campaign/ security policy to allow access of Occupation Certificate to buildings older thon 15 years; Cancellation of increased property tax and increased water bill in case of buildings older than 15 years; Policy decision for the use of Fungible FSI of discounted rates to regulate additional carpet area covered by flowerbed, balcony; Immediate possession of reserved and facility land plots developed under Reservation

to make them available for public use; Logging redevelopment of 103 Municipal markets in Mumbai will be completed in 5 years; Additional galas available in market redevelopment will be used for rehabilitation of project affected and hawkers and footpaths will be cleared; "Mumbai Bajarhot" will be started of free facility plots in Mumbai; Reserved galas will be made available on rent in municipal markets for products from konkan; Mumbai Nagpur Samruddhi Corridor; Mumbai Delhi Corridor; Mumbai-Pune-Nashik Ahmedabad Bullet Train; Sewri-Nhava Shev Trans Harbour Link way connecting Mumbai and Navi Mumbai within 30 minutes will be completed; Metro Projects- 2,3, 4, 5, 6.7 will be completed before year 2022 and passenger capacity will be increased by additional 90 lakh Passenger; Passenger carrying capacity will be doubled from present with construction of High, Railway on present railway route (Rail-over-rail); Row-row water transport will be started. Borivali- Nariman point, Belapur - Gate way, Bandra, Juhu, Charkop, Versova, Tender process initiated Rope-way transport will be started between Mumbai and Navi Mumbai and Uttan-Gorai-Borivali; 500 Wi-Fi spots started in Mumbai; 4717 CCTV cameras - 24 hours electronic surveillance system active; irregular traffic in Mumbai will regularised with use of state-of-the art technology by Digital Policing using CCTV in Wi-Fi Mumbai; BJP',s central government scheme- Now three independent residents by Mumbai port Trust available for cancer patients undergoing treatment in Mumbai; Free Wi-Fi will be made available for citizens of all main roads, public markets, gardens, Crowded areas; Large CCTV Network will be built up of public places. schools, bus stands, hospitals, gardens and crowded areas by following up with State Government.; Wi-Fi system and CCTV system will be co-ordinated with Municipal Corporation- Mumbai Police-Mumbai Fire Brigade- Disaster Management System and in turn third eye will keep watch on of crimes-criminals and Disaster Management will be strengthened and mode effective; Power generated from non-conventional sources like solar energy- wind energy will be used in various Municipal buildings and complexes.

#### 4. Disaster Management (4)

Additional Disaster Management Center will be established in the east and west suburbs; Fire Department and hospitals, State of art systems will be created for management; Non-government organisations helping in the disaster management will be connected with the Disaster Management Center; Disaster Management Training Center will be established. Through this center, a Disaster Management Volunteer force will be created.

#### 5. Fire Brigade (6)

Number of Fire Brigade Stations will be increased. Number of Fire Brigade stations will be decided considering geographical area based on population; Mini fire tenders will be made available for gaothans, koliwadas, hilly areas, etc.; State-of-the art and scientific firefighting equipments will be purchased to make it reachable in high-rise buildings.; Special training centres will be started for Fire Brigade; Considering this proper fire resistance uniform and equipment/material will be provided to every fire officer and fireman; Wireless fire panic button will be installed in each building using Wi-Fi system and through it each building may be connected to control room of Fire Brigade by pressing just one button

#### 6. Flood (3)

Additional FSI will be given to the residents residing in the low level areas which suffer from floods.; Additional Water Expressing Centres will be established to drain the rain water speedily.; A network of small rain water lines will be created on the roads in Mumbai and the missing links will be found out to make the water flow network complete.



# 7. Holistic Development (10)

Theatres will be developed oi facility plots in Mumbai city; Development and beautification of Hoi Ali in Mumbai will be undertaken; Cemetery for siya muslims will be developed; Recreation center for senior citizens will be started in each zone; Special school center will be started in each zone for mentally handicapped. Free bus service will be made available to such students; Mumbai will be made banner-free by removing all unauthorised banners, hoardings; To enhance participation of citizens in administration, a meeting will be called under chairmanship of Ward committee in each zone once o month to communicate with non-government and social organizations; To implement 'Hoppy Street' concept for citizens in each zone necessary arrangement will be mode by corporation; Premises will be made available for construction of fuel canters, CNG gas/Petrol=diesel station for vehicles on East-West High Ways and important roads; Special policy will be framed to encourage registered 30,152 business and professions in Mumbai for generation of employment and self-employment

# 8. Municipal Hospital (10)

Make use of Health Information Management System to entirely computerize the health service provided in all the major and minor hospitals of the Municipality; Install RISPACK (Radiology Information System Picture Archival Communication System) in every major hospital; build individual hospitals in east and west suburban for the treatment of infectious diseases; make additional 500 ventilators available in the hospitals in Mumbai; redevelop TB Hospital; Build special hospitals for AIDS control; Girl child is born in the Municipal Corporation Hospital, on amount of Rs. 5000/- will be kept as fixed deposit in the name of that girl child for 18 years; build trauma centre and dialysis centre in each hospitals; Build a special hospital for treatment of cancer in the jurisdiction of Municipality; Improve ICU capacity and ventilators in hospitals.

# 9. Municipal School Education (16)

Build new schools for physically challenged students in every administrative ward and to take them to and fro these schools a free special bus service will be made available; Strict implementation of Right to Education Act; Special campaign to improve the number of Marathi schools and Marathi Medium Students; Increase in the number of semi-English mediums along with other mediums; Commission of Kindergarten (KG) classes in all Municipality schools; Maintenance of digital catalogue to reduce & control the student dropout rate; Erection of updated computer labs in all Municipality schools; Improvement in capacity to gain knowledge through digital classrooms along with updated educational material, equipment's and audio visual technology; Special focus on cleanliness in Municipality schools; Independent website of education department and availability of educational material; Erection of Dr. Abdul Kalam Educational Science Centre to improve students interest in Science; Organisation of various study tours for Municipality students; Study rooms and libraries in Municipality schools; Strict quality control of the nutritional value of Mid-day Meal food and achievement of quality improvement; implementation of Central Government's Skill Development Programme for Seventh and Eighth Standard students; Complete the process of appointing sufficient number of teachers

# 10. New Road Project (7)

No street tax till new roads are not made; a network-of elevated roads near the rail roads will be created by the Municipal Corporation; As per Municipal Corporation Act, clause 61(N), it is mandatary to wash the roads and clean the roads; Clause of utility duct will be included in the roads contracts; More bright with use of L.E.D. bulbs at all street lamps and electricity will be saved on a big scale; High mast L.E.D. lights will be installed of major junctions of main roads; Streetlights will be provided in slum areas.

# 11. Open Spaces (19)

Protection of all open spaces; Development and beautification of open spaces will be done as well as suggestions will be entertained by the local people before the implementation; Open spaces will be kept open for public; Erection of mobile tower in a garden will be prohibited; Beautification of Powai Lake and of all other lakes; Cleaning and beautification of coastline and beaches; Erection of CCTV system on sea beaches for security, also life guard will be stationed; Stationing of cleanliness volunteer unit for 24 hour maintaining of cleanliness of sea beaches; Establishment of independent authority for the purpose of cleaning, purification and beautification rivers; Commencement of water sports on water fronts; Appointment of committee of environmental experts to study the hazardous as well as environmental friendly elements for Mumbai; Protection and conservation of 12859 hectares of Natural area that constitutes 29.59% of total area of Mumbai; Strict penal action against things that are harmful to the environment; Use of satellite images and camera drone for protection of mangrove forests and lands; Construction of Mangrove park on a forty acre plot in Mulund as well as in Kandivali Chorkop; Large scale plantation of trees in Mumbai city. Felicitation by the Mayor of the participants and NGO's that plant and adopt more than 3000 trees; Making of 1503 silent zone areas in Mumbai free from noise pollution by sound absorbing/cutting technology like MMRDA of the state government; Erection of smoke towers to measure and control the pollution level; Completion of Noise Level Mapping in Mumbai. Along with air pollution, to control noise pollution, measurement with decibel metres of levels of noise by vehicles and other sources and proper action against them



#### 12. Planning of Hawker and Peddlers (8)

Planning and regulation of the street hawkers; Provision of all facilities to hawkers and peddlers to do their businesses in a respectful manner.; planning and regulation of hawker and peddler business via guidance system; Surveys of hawkers and peddlers to determine and give a fixed timing of business and areas of operation; Mobile hawkers and peddlers permit for those who operate on two-wheelers, three-wheelers and four-wheelers; Issuance of permit for former weekly market in big housing societies as per no objection certificate and recommendation of the said society; Official spaces and licences to miscellaneous professionals such as leather workers, flower-garland sellers and newspaper sellers; Reservation for physically challenged in hawkers and peddlers area

#### 13. Potholes (1)

Policy of making roods in Mumbai free of potholes in five years

#### 14. Property Tax (4)

Property tax rates will be stabilised for 5 years; Each property holder will receive individual property bill; Abhay scheme will be implemented for recovery of arrears of property tax; Special discount will be given to green and environment supporting buildings using unconventional energy, classifying wet and dry waste, and reusing-drainage water

#### 15. Public Health (12)

Introduce o Citizen Smart Health Card for the citizen and these cardholders will be provided a free body check-up once every year; Conduct o health survey of Mumbaikars; Implement Mumbai Mahanagarpalika Jeevandayi Aarogya Yojana; Make available a Rs.5 lakhs per family/per year Health Insurance Cover; Available the essential medicines for free. For that purpose, will update the list of medicines. Focus will be on more utilisation of generic medicines; Introduce a telemedicine consultancy; Expand blood component lab; Introduce skin bank in Mumbai; Introduce a special outpatient ward for poor patients operational from 7.00 PM to IO.00 PM; Make available independent patient word (paid ward) for patients or reasonable rates; Introduce a Yog Training Centre and Yogic Healing Treatment Centre at every ward and will make integrated medicines and treatments available; Improve the current undergraduate and postgraduate student admission capacity of the Municipal Medical College

#### 16. Road Tendering (1)

People will be given double financial compensation to the people affected by road widening

#### 17. Sanitation (1)

Free water and electricity will be provided to the public toilets in the slums

#### 18. Sewerage (7)

Immediate attention will be paid to the 50% un-sewerage areas and a time bound program will be established to create a network of sewerage systems.; the sewerage connection will be made available to anybody who applies for the same.; Municipal Corporation will establish eight S.T.P. (Sewerage Treatment Plant).; In the remote areas - hilly areas the modern technologies such as micro-tunnelling will be used; S.T.Ps will be made compulsory for re-use of waste water in industrial areas, commercial complexes, non-residential offices and big residential complexes; Avoid thefts of the lids of chambers of the sewerage lines, new lids made with fibre will be used to avoid potholes created by its weight; Scheme of toilet for every home will be implemented in all the slums and for the same the work of sewerage systems

# 19. Social culture/ Tourism / Encouragement to Mumbai Tourism / Monuments Of The Great Personalities/Marathi Pride (26)

"Redevelopment policy" will be framed for giving justice to sons of soil of gaothon, Koliwadas; Special efforts will be made to provide basic amenities to residents in C.R.Z. area; Upgradation of walkaways, lighting, lavatories, sanitation, etc. for sons of soil Koli, Agari, ST's of Gaothan, Koliwada, etc.; Permission to be granted for repairing homes in Gaothon, Koliwada by relaxing stringent conditions; Health centres/mobile dispensary will be made available in Gaothon - Koliwada area; independent closets/ shades will be constructed of various places for sell of fish for koli women; Agari - Koli Bhavan to be built; Work lagging behind in Zoo will be completed in one year; Clean state-of-the art and strong cages and other facilities will be made available on priority basis to give justice to Indian animals.; 23 Theme gardens/gardens will be developed; New Indian animals and birds will be brought; Interpretation Zoo, Aquarium, cafeteria and administrative office will be started newly immediately in constructed building; Work of Entrance plaza will be completed; A lesson on Samyukta Maharashtra Movement will be included in the curriculum of each student learning; A special scheme for preservation of Marathi language will be implemented by Municipal corporation. Efforts will be made by this deportment to use Marathi on computers and websites to maximum extent; Mumbai Marathi Sahitya Sammelan' will be organised; Mumbai Museum Gallery will be constructed exhibiting History of Mumbai and Pride and Culture of Maharashtra; Mumbai's local deity "Shri Mumbadevi Mandir Area" will be developed; Marathi Granthsangrahalaya will be upgraded; Corporation's theatres will be made available to Marathi drama of discounted rates on priority basis; independent Tourism Development Department will be started in corporation for encouraging Mumbai Tourism; Eastern seo coast will be opened for tourism. Attractive water fronts. cruise terminal, row-row transport, marine plaza, water sports and theme garden will be developed in thot area.; Services like Nilmbari, Vibhavari best buses and amphibian duck buses will be provided and upgraded to encourage Mumbai Darshan tourism; In the Indian Ocean, the tallest monument of international quality of Chatrapati Shivaji Maharaj will be created; A gigantic monument of Dr. Babasaheb Ambedkar of Indu Mill; A giant monument of Hindu Hriday Samrat Balasaheb Thakare



# 20. Solid Waste Management (SWM) (10)

free dust bins will be provided for the classification of wet waste and dry waste; Call 24x7 waste collection will be done to implement the Zero Waste campaign; Number of small waste carrying carts (ghanta gadi) will be increased and the waste in the slum areas and remote areas will be collected.; Housing societies which will carry out classification of waste into dry waste and wet waste will be given financial incentives in the tax system; Vehicle Tracking System under GPS system will be used on approx. 1500 waste carrying vehicles making 3746 trips daily; Clean area voluntary group will be created under the Special Cleanliness Campaign in the slum areas and in chawls. ; Slum Adoption scheme (Dattak Vasti Yojana) will be implemented effectively; For the solid waste management, considering that the capacity of waste process land in Mumbai is finished, alternate arrangements will be established in Mumbai Mahanagar boundaries.; Project for generating electricity from waste will be implemented; Systems will be established to lift the debris and process ii to create sand for the construction material and re-use the some

# 21. Traffic Management (6)

Traffic Comprehensive Mobility Plan prepared by the state government will be implemented by the year 2020 and the Western Free Way; State of art signalling systems will be established; Traffic guidance will be made available using the state of art G.P.S. systems; Follow up with the state government will be done and expansion of Eastern Express Freeway will be carried out from Govandi to Ghatkopar-Thane and will be connected to the Metro-4 route; Providing of parking palace at railway stations, bus stands, rickshaw stands and crowded places; SATIS(Station area traffic improvement scheme) will be implemented.

# 22. Transparent administration/Tendering Contactor/Citizen Participation (21)

Some contractors in Mumbai municipal corporation have provided low quality work for which their cartel will be put to an end so big contractors can work; Municipal corporation will enter into joint ventures for contract work; Changes in law will make it compulsory for the officers of municipal corporation to show their balance sheet; The persons who are helping cartels in tenders and opposing the E-tender will be booked under organized crime.; The information about proposed and sanctioned proposals of the Mumbai Municipal corporation will be published in a transparent manner for the citizens of Mumbai; In every six months funds allotted to the corporators and their details will be provided in a booklet form and electronic form for all citizens free of cost.; Citizens who inform about thefts or persons involved in theft or help in increasing municipal corporation's income will be given 10% without disclosing their names; A ,Up-Lokayukta, designation will be created as per the present laws in the Mumbai Municipal Corporation jurisdiction, for the citizens of Mumbai.; Whenever the citizens of Mumbai lodge complaints, these complaints are finally entangled in the maze of the legal department procedures of the Municipal Corporation.; Every year, one audit of the balance sheet of Mumbai Municipal Corporation will be carried out and its report will be published in a simple language for the common public.; If there are variations In the given contracts then a Third Party Audit will be carried out for the same.; In one year suggestions and proposals will be invites from the citizens; The complaints submitted by citizens and action taken for the same will be informed to citizens by a SMS.; The force of inviting consultation from consultants, opinions from experts, scheduled rate, earnest money etc. will be carried out by expert committee and their suggestions will be implemented within six months.; As per the Right to Service Act, a Right to Municipal Service Act will be proposed and Citizen Charter will be established.; It will be made compulsory for the elected corporators to conduct Area Meetings under the 'Nagarraj Bill'.; The entire administration of Municipal Corporation Head Office and Divisional Office will be connected through video conferencing; Financial incentive will be given to those citizens in Mumbai who will carry out all services, facilities, transactions hundred percent cashless; A separate mobile app for municipal corporation to submit complaints and suggestions for citizens; A Special Force will be established to implement the suggestions given in the internal and external audit report of the Municipal Corporation.; An inquiry of the Educational, Health and other projects, initiated during the lost twenty years in the Municipal Corporation under P.P.P. contracts and their current status will be carried out by a retired judge.

# 23. Water Supply (13)

Water for any one, For the next 5 years; 24 hours water supply will be provided; Right to water- who ever applies for water will be supplied water; Where no taps are there water will be provided through tankers; 750 litres per day per family; The Water Projects of Gargoi. Pinjal, Damanganga will be completed and 3200 MLD additional water will be made available; Water Purification systems will be improved; Protection of bigger main water lines, along with the security guards, E-security guards, i.e. C.C.T.V. cameras will be fitted; Modernization of Water Hydrant will be carried out for prompt emergency management and removal of complaints about contaminated water. The Water Hydrant will be cleaned with a time bound program.; Stop the monopoly of the licensed plumbers, on area-wise panel of the licensed plumbers will be prepared and fixed rates will be decided for the services offered; Processing plant will be established to convert the saline water of the ocean into potable water; Wherever there is no tap connection, Municipal Corporation will supply water through tankers; Time bound program will be designed to fight this dreadful problem and will be implemented immediately



# 24. Women, children, youth & Welfare of youth / Senior citizens (15)

Increased Special Financial Provision for women in gender budget; Commission of women employment, training centres for selfemployment, Sakhi-Kendras, Women Support Centres and Skill Development Centres; Consultation Centre for technical guidance and financial help in self-employment; Fully-equipped maternity homes; NICU & Infant Specialty Ward in Mumbai City and Suburbs; Right To Pee - E-Toilets will be created for women in the vicinity of one kilometre and the information about these will be made available on mobile apps; Availability of sanitary napkin handing machine and sanitary napkin disposable machine in ladies' toilets.; Sports grounds with modern facilities will be created for youth; Premises with more than 10000 sq. ft. space available there football court, basketball court, etc. and gymnasium to be erected; Swimming pool will be constructed in each administrative zone; Indoor stadium will be constructed in each zone; Study room and digital library will be constructed for students; Skill development center will be constructed for youth; Self-employment counselling center will be constructed for youth; Mayor Trophy Competition will be organised for country sports of Mumbai level



# Table 63: Shiv Sena (SS) Manifesto

#### Manifesto Points

# 1. Affordable houses (1)

Gharkul' scheme for sanitation workers and other municipal employees

#### 2. Best Transport (3)

Unified budget for BMC and BEST; To start small buses for people living in suburbs; Integrated bus, metro and local pass

#### 3. Development Plan (2)

To classify koliwadas as 'gaothans' to allow their development; To retain Aarey colony as a green zone under the new Development Plan.

#### 4. Disaster Management

5. Fire Brigade

#### 6. Flood (1)

New pumping stations at Mogra and Mahul

#### 7. Municipal Hospital (4)

To set up a medical college in Shatabdi hospital; To set up a Cath lab at Cooper Hospital; To set up special hospitals for management of diabetes; Stores selling generic medicines in civic hospitals

#### 8. Municipal School Education (6)

Encouragement to skill development and vocational training; To set up e-libraries in island city as well as suburbs; Starting selfdefence training for girls; Priority in BMC jobs to be given to students from BMC schools; To set up a 'sangeet' academy in every ward; Better and more nutritious mid-day meals

#### 9. New Road Project (3)

Completion of the Goregaon-Mulund Link Road project; Two-wheeler stands for citizens and dabbawalas near stations; Completion of the Coastal Road project

#### 10. Open Spaces (2)

To construct new gardens, and also undertake beautification of traffic islands; More spaces to be created for sports to be played on open grounds

#### 11. Planning of Hawker and Peddlers

#### 12. Potholes

#### 13. Property Tax (2)

Property tax waived off for houses less than 500 sq. feet; Concession in property tax to be given to houses larger than 700 sq. feet if they segregate waste, conduct rain water harvesting, etc.

#### 14. Public Health (4)

Balasaheb Thackeray Aarogya Kawach Yojana; To set up modern facilities for healthcare of sanitation workers; To introduce ambulances which can serve multiple patients at a time for use in disaster or emergency situations; To introduce 'OPD on wheels' project to ensure health at citizens' doorsteps

#### 15. Road Tendering

#### 16. Sanitation (1)

To increase the number of public toilets

#### 17. Sewerage

# 18. Social culture/ Tourism / Encouragement to Mumbai Tourism / Monuments Of The Great Personalities/Marathi Pride (4)

A memorial will be constructed as a tribute to Marathi theatre; To set up a memorial for freedom fighters; To create a tourist attraction on the eastern shoreline; To construct a 'Dabbawala bhawan'

#### 19. Solid Waste Management (SWM) (1)

Garbage processing centre to be set up at Deonar dumping ground



# 20. Traffic Management

# 21. Water Supply (2)

To set up treatment plants for reusing sewage water; To complete Gargai, Pinjal projects at the earliest

22. Women, children, youth & Welfare of youth / Senior citizens (3)

Sanitary napkin vending machines in toilets for women; To set up recreation centres for senior citizens; To construct a football ground as well as an international level training centre for shooting.



# Table 64: Indian National Congress (INC) Manifesto

1	Δffor	dahle	houses
т.	AIIUI	uavie	nouses

2. Best Transport

# 3. Development Plan

#### 4. Disaster Management

#### 5. Fire Brigade

#### 6. Flood

# 7. Municipal Hospital (2)

Free medicines will be distributed in all Municipal hospitals; After co-ordinating with the private hospital doctors, special panel will be established for providing free service at Municipal Corporation hospitals

**Manifesto Points** 

#### 8. Municipal School Education (6)

To make sure that every BMC school is made as the same level as Right to Education (RTE); Many schools which have been closed will now be made open; Structure of all the schools will be upgraded; The shortage in the number of teachers will be removed; International School Plan- In the start we will develop one BMC school and make it of an international level and with that experience will make all the schools in the city of that level; Each ward will have an advanced digital and traditional library; Students of Municipal School will get free bus pass for travelling upto 5 kms.

# 9. New Road Project (3)

In the coming 7 years, all roads will be built of concrete; It would be ensured that with new roads, useful ducts would be made; Each ward will have an engineer team appointed to look after the roads

# 10. Open Spaces (6)

All the open spaces like RG, PG, garden will come under the possession of Municipal Corporation; Maintenance of all the open spaces will be done by Municipal Corporation; Mumbai people will now get free entry at all open spaces; An independent department will be appointed by Municipal Corporation to look after the open spaces; Political leaders who have taken the possession of the open spaces and encroached on these spaces, action will be taken against them and the lands will be taken and their shops will be shut; Identification of the poor slums near the open spaces so that we can improve the living conditions of the poor people

# 11. Planning of Hawker and Peddlers (4)

Hawker Protection Act passed in the parliament will be followed in accordance; All the hawkers working in Mumbai will be given a legal licence so as to stop the bribe that they pay, which will also help in giving justice to the traders and residents; Arrangements to make available nice, clean and free sidewalk on all paths in Mumbai; Proper legal system to be implemented so that the hawkers carry on with their work on their demarcated places

#### 12. Potholes (1)

Complaints on potholes to be addressed within 24 hours

# 13. Property Tax (4)

Property tax waived off for houses less than 500 sq. feet; To make the Clearance Department more skilled and to incorporate transparency and will reduce the price of houses; Organising of Citizen Meetings in every 3 months with BMC officers and steering committee heads; Organising of people gatherings in every 3 months with ward level officers and municipal servants for discussion of grievances

# 14. Public Health (7)

In Municipal Corporation's budget, funds for the health service will be raised by 15%; Under the policy, 'Doctor Aapke Dwaar Par', ambulatory clinics will be opened up in each constituency. Will have one doctor, one nurse and medicines free of cost for the patients; Free transport facility for the pregnant women during their puerperium for their visits to the hospital ; Free blood will be made available at blood banks at all health departments of BMC ; Free yearly health check-ups for the women of the age group 20-40 years; Two to three times increase in the number of doctors and health staff at municipal corporation



# 15. Road Tendering (1)

Appointment of an independent audit team for the inspection of the condition of all roads- grouping and classification of all roads will be done

#### 16. Sanitation

#### 17. Sewerage

18. Social culture/ Tourism / Encouragement to Mumbai Tourism / Monuments Of The Great Personalities/Marathi Pride

#### 19. Solid Waste Management (SWM) (5)

The first motive is to make Mumbai clean and trash free; Arrangement to shift all the three dumping grounds out of Mumbai; International methods for the disposal of wastes will be brought to Mumbai; Alike international cities, process for the production of electricity, gas, compost by wastes will be started; To treat every drop of dirty water in Mumbai, Dirty Water Process Plant will be made ready at many places

#### 20. Subsidized Meals (2)

Municipal Corporation Canteen- Municipal Corporation canteens will be opened up in many places which will provide full meal at low prices. In the start, this policy will start at all major centres. Afterwards, this facility will be opened for all the citizens in many parts of the city; 'Manpa Thali' will be given at the least rate of Rs. 20 for the general public at Municipal canteens, full meal at Rs. 20 will be provided.

#### 21. Traffic Management (1)

Study of the intelligent traffic distribution and management will be done, so that, in times of heavy traffic the reason for the traffic jam and distribution is ascertained

#### 22. Transparent administration/Tendering Contactor/Citizen Participation

#### 23. Water Supply (6)

Free drinking water for each family as per their necessity; Every household will get water connection for Rs. 1500; Will work on reducing water leakage, aim is to reduce the leakage by 10-15%; Establishment of fully advanced digital system to measure the water flow in the city and to prevent any water theft and water leakage; 100% water meter policy to be implemented without any pendency; Aim to make Mumbai tanker-free

#### 24. Women, children, youth & Welfare of youth / Senior citizens (14)

Availability of advanced digital and traditional library (for various competitive exams) with newspapers, computers and Wi-Fi; Free bus travelling pass for the graduate students; One Sports School for every five ward to promote youth for a healthy lifestyle and to pursue a career in sports. International level center for Olympics and other games. ; Training center for the development of the reading-speaking skills of English and Marathi language for better job opportunities; Mumbai Students Self Career- Youth of the age group 15-25 years helping in the cleanliness programme of BMC for 5 days in a year will be given smartphone and free Wi-Fi for a year. ; Under the Municipal Corporation Canteen Policy, prominence will be given to the Women Self Help Group by creating jobs for them; High standard toilets will be built across Mumbai only for women with the availability of free sanitary napkin vending machines; Skill Development Centre will be opened to promote women's talents; Women and Children homes for poor women; Availability of open spaces near poor slums so that the mothers can spend time with their kids; Easy accessibility towards health wellness of women and their children; Joint venture of Municipal Corporation with Mumbai Police for women safety; Reserved tables for women at Municipal Corporation canteens will be run by Women's Self Help Group.

# Table 65: National Congress Party (NCP) Manifesto

#### Manifesto Points

# 1. Affordable houses

#### 2. Best Transport (4)

Mini bus services for localities far from railway stations; Connecting buses to trains, metro and monorails; For electricity users, waiving of all charges except electricity tax; Land allotted for BEST bus stands, electricity sub-stations, etc. will not be sold and will be used for their designated purposes.

#### 3. Development Plan (4)

Mobile markets at ward levels; To set up a fish market to be run by women in every ward; To construct toilets for women in fish markets; Concession on property and water tax

#### 4. Disaster Management

#### 5. Fire Brigade (3)

To acquire land marked under DCR to construct fire station; To set up two separate fire stations in the suburbs; Rules will be modified to introduce new methods of fire-fighting for high-rises

#### 6. Flood

#### 7. Municipal Hospital (6)

To ensure that civic hospitals have adequate facilities such as trauma centres, CT scans, etc.; To make the Sewri TB hospital a worldclass and modern hospital; To set up two municipal hospitals of the standard of KEM hospital in the western and eastern suburbs; To improve security and install CCTVs in municipal hospitals; Stores selling generic medicines in civic hospitals; Laboratory testing facilities to be available in civic hospitals

#### 8. Municipal School Education (6)

To improve condition of municipal school buildings which are in a dilapidated condition in accordance with the report of the Justice Dhanuka committee; To provide life insurance scheme for all civic school students; Plots reserved for schools will be used only for that purpose; To give encouragement to students who excel in sports and arts.; Priority in BMC jobs to be given to students from BMC schools; Municipal corporation will bear the cost of further education of students who score more than 75% marks

#### 9. New Road Project (3)

Streetlights running on solar energy to be constructed; Blacklisting of contractors who do substandard work; Widening of narrow roads

# 10. Open Spaces (5)

Beautification of all chowpaties; Installation of CCTV cameras on open grounds for safety; To ensure drinking water facility on existing municipal grounds; Jogging track and open gym in municipal gardens; To make 'Ranicha baug' a site of international standards

#### 11. Planning of Hawker and Peddlers (4)

To conduct discussions with citizens on doubling number of hawker zones; Modernization of Deonar abattoir; To implement hawkers policy; To construct pavements which are free from hawkers

#### 12. Potholes (2)

To pay special attention to potholes; To fix a pothole within a day and to take action against contractor within one week

#### 13. Property Tax (1)

To reduce the difference between the property tax of old buildings and new buildings



# 14. Public Health (5)

Implementation of Mumbaikar health insurance scheme; To employ medicinal sprays at night to prevent contagious diseases; To increase the municipal budget for health and to implement it; On swamps and salt pans, insecticides will be sprayed; To start online OPD/counselling centre 'Hello doctor'; Special schemes for TB-free Mumbai

# 15. Road Tendering (1)

Tenders at an international level will be sought for widening/renovation of roads

#### 16. Sanitation

#### 17. Sewerage (3)

To complete the BRIMSTOWAD project at the earliest; To cover open drains; To construct closed drainage system for entire suburban area

# 18. Social culture/ Tourism / Encouragement to Mumbai Tourism / Monuments Of The Great Personalities/Marathi Pride (2)

Setting up of new auditoriums and an art gallery; Creating new tourist spot such as snow park, marine aquarium

#### 19. SWM (5)

To create a 'Clean Up' App to receive complaints about dumping of solid waste; To generate electricity from solid waste, and use it for BMC; To create a waste disposal centre in every division; To give concession on property tax for societies which segregate dry and wet waste; Large canals to be covered

#### 20. Subsidized Meals

#### 21. Traffic Management (1)

To set up multiple-storeyed parking lots and also set up underground parking lots

# 22. Water Supply (6)

To create and implement a plan to create new projects on Kalu, Shahi, Gargai and Pinjar rivers; To increase the capacity of water tanks in water treatment plants at Panjrapol and Bhandup; Constructing new water tanks and increasing capacity of old ones; To roll back the 8% increase in water tax; To stop collection of various sewage taxes from slum-dwellers; To levy equal tax on people who live in buildings without completion certificate, rather than double tax

# 23. Women, children, youth & Welfare of youth / Senior citizens (10)

Women's SHGs to be given priority in providing mid-day meals in schools; Creches to be started in every ward; Corporation to provide space for women's SHGs to sell their products; Women's SHGs to be given priority in managing parking lots and public toilets; To implement schemes giving 50% concession to women in healthcare services; Corporation to run courses in running beauty parlours, mehndi, stitching, typing, etc.; Setting up of day care centres in addition to old age homes; 75% concession in BEST buses for senior citizens; Appointing an officer in every ward for welfare of senior citizens; Free health check-up every three months in PHC centres